



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 71815

**Title:** In memoriam of Thomas Earl Starzl, the pioneer of liver transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer’s code:** 05703005

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MRCP

**Professional title:** Senior Research Fellow

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-09-22

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-09-24 19:08

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-09-25 11:15

**Review time:** 16 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This article aims to give an overview of Thomas Starzl's life work. It must be acknowledged tho whilst the is entitled a memoriam - he did pass away 4 years ago and some of the language needs to reflect that. Currently, there is too little focus on his successes both scientifically, surgically and in developing the transplant community and this needs to be improved on prior to publication. - Starzl passed away in 2017 so the comment about how Starzl's death deeply saddens all transplant surgeons around the world should be in the past tense (and there is an argument that it is redundant given the passing of this amount of time) - He also worked at the University of Pittsburgh which should be mentioned in the introduction - Whilst it is important to acknowledge Bennie (note two ns) Solis' transplant - it is given too much focus with little mentioned of his successes - the immunosuppression development is vital and needs to be expanded on, it may also be worth discussing his relationship with his surviving patients as well as clinicians around the world (notably Roy Calne) which led to further developments in the field of transplantation. - The special comment is a lovely anecdote which does state a lot for his role in the development of colleagues - it perhaps could be reduced in length



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 71815

**Title:** In memoriam of Thomas Earl Starzl, the pioneer of liver transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer’s code:** 03755068

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Consultant Physician-Scientist

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-09-22

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-09-26 08:30

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-09-26 08:54

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This was a short article about the pioneer of liver transplantation, prof. Starzl. The first part of this manuscript briefly summarized the career of Prof. Starzl, whereas in the second part, one of the Author described his personal relationship with him. I have no comments on this paper. I would only suggest to correct some typos (e.g., her instead of his), and to add a sentence in the first part dealing with the ethical principles that led his career.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 71815

**Title:** In memoriam of Thomas Earl Starzl, the pioneer of liver transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05226054

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-09-22

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-09-25 22:35

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-10-02 19:55

**Review time:** 6 Days and 21 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Very interesting and well written memoir for Thomas E. Starzl. The draft needs proof reading and has few grammar errors.