

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Transplantation*

Manuscript NO: 75011

Title: Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05378296

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Romania

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-29 16:34

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-02 14:47

Review time: 3 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Kidney Disease in Non-Renal Solid Organ Transplantation Population: A Review" prepared by K.J. Swanson provides data regarding the current literature about kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation. The manuscript is organised into several sections in which the author point out the most relevant data regarding kidney diseases after pancreas, lung, liver, heart and intestinal transplantation. To improve the manuscript, we recommend: Major points: 1. In the materials and methods section, an expansion of the data presented or a figure related to the research process conducted in the different databases could be a good factor to highlight the information presented. 2. The tables should be associated with legends. Minor point: 1. In the sentence "While quantifying the prevalence of CKD in any population is a daunting task, several studies have noted an incidence of CKD in non-kidney solid organ transplant ranging between 6-21%" the author should add a reference related to the data presented.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Transplantation*

Manuscript NO: 75011

Title: Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05384570

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Malaysia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-29 05:10

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-07 14:55

Review time: 9 Days and 9 Hours

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting article on kidney disease in patients with nonrenal transplantation with comprehensive overview. Great work!

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Transplantation*

Manuscript NO: 75011

Title: Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05022758

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Poland

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-30 15:38

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-09 14:12

Review time: 9 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Undoubtedly, chronic kidney disease is an extremely important clinical issue in organ transplant patients. The author undertook the difficult task of reviewing the literature, for which he should be congratulated. However, several important shortcomings should be mentioned. Author doesn't provide accurate numbers when quoting other authors - i.e. "non-CNI related causes of kidney disease have been implicated at rates between 27-40% in solid organ transplant recipients who have undergone kidney biopsies". Such numbers don't appear in the original article. The author also doesn't mention the fact that CNI related causes of nephrotoxicity in the same work accounted for 46-60% of cases and constituted the largest group of reported histologic lesions. Organ specific paragraphs constitute of chaotic presentation of random manuscripts providing a compilation of abstracts with no clear clinical application in mind. Despite a vast amount of available data on CNI minimalization strategies, the author does not provide a reliable and clinically useful review. Moreover the suggestion that the use of belatacept is a safe immunosuppressive strategy in liver transplant patients is at most controversial. A single quoted manuscript by LaMattina constituted of a small group of patients which were subsequently converted to CNI. Most of betalaccept studies in liver transplantation show higher incidence of rejections rates, death and PTLT (particular in EBV "- patients). With the available data the use of belatacept cannot be recommended in liver transplant recipients. Additional studies with sufficient power are needed to determine efficacy of belatacept in the liver transplant population. While I appreciate the considerable amount of work that went into preparing the manuscript, it is extremely difficult for me to recommend this review as clinically valuable.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Transplantation*

Manuscript NO: 75011

Title: Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05022758

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Poland

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-29

Reviewer chosen by: Jing-Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-22 07:04

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-22 07:09

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the revision. The overall quality of the manuscript has increased.