PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Meta-Analysis*

Manuscript NO: 84392

Title: Evidence relating cigarette, cigar and pipe smoking to lung cancer and COPD. Meta-analysing recent data from three regions.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06286982

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-14 12:36

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-22 15:39

Review time: 8 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [Y] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[Y] Yes [ ] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very interesting study addressing a timely topic in lung cancer. Some changes are needed. - The introduction should be expanded and the authors should add some recently published papers regarding the evolving systemic treatment scenario for lung cancer (PMID: 35326555; PMID: 36368251 ; PMID: 36064585; PMID: 33053439). - The limitations of the current manuscript should be better discussed and reported, including the heterogeneity of data. - The discussion should be expanded and a more personal perspective should be included. Major changes needed.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Meta-Analysis*

Manuscript NO: 84392

Title: Evidence relating cigarette, cigar and pipe smoking to lung cancer and COPD. Meta-analysing recent data from three regions.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06140863

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Academic Research, Assistant Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-13

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-12 12:29

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-24 09:46

Review time: 11 Days and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[Y] Yes [ ] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have developed an interesting and extensive work on the relationship between smoking and lung cancer and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). The issue has been studied for decades, but it continues to be a problem for the health of the world population today.The work is coherent and the methodology is correct. In order to improve the quality of the work I will include two suggestions: - The introduction is very short. It could be expanded by briefly analyzing the state of the art. - Data on the use of electronic cigarettes could be included in the discussion.