

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 86645

Title: Simultaneous pancreas-kidney transplantation for end-stage renal failure in Type

1 diabetes Mellitus: Current perspectives

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03546647

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-02 14:39

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-02 18:00

Review time: 3 Hours

	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [Y] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[Y] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [Y] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [] Rejection
Re-review	[Y]Yes []No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The narrative review herein presented fails to deliver any new message on the topic. Remarkably, despite covering all major aspects of SPK transplantation, the manuscript remains on the surface, avoiding any personal point of view that may help navigating in current controversies. In order to increase the interest of the readers, I would recommend to include deeper and more focused discussion sections on the most crucial issues related to pancreas transplantation. Also, it would be relevant to analyze why the number of pancreas transplant centers worldwide has not increased over time, and possible strategies aiming to favor the expansion of existing pancreas transplantation programs. Offering further insight on what could be the future of SPK in the context of advanced islets transplantation would be equally appreciated.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 86645

Title: Simultaneous pancreas-kidney transplantation for end-stage renal failure in Type

1 diabetes Mellitus: Current perspectives

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02524651

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-17 23:32

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-20 01:58

Review time: 2 Days and 2 Hours

	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	 []Grade A: Excellent [Y]Grade B: Good []Grade C: Fair []Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	 [] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	 [] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [] Rejection
Re-review	[Y]Yes []No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript "Simultaneous pancreas-kidney transplantation for end-stage renal failure in Type 1 diabetes Mellitus: Current perspectives", the authors reviewed compiles the latest evidence and current recommendations of SPKT for patients with T1DM and advanced CKD/ESRF to enable clinicians to care for these diseases. This review describes the whole process of SPK which is useful for understanding SPK in general, however, more details are needed to improve the valuable. 1, HISTORY OF SIMULTANEOUS PANCREAS-KIDNEY TRANSPLANTATION. The change of SPKTs number from the beginning to year 2022 should be presented in a figure. 2, INDICATIONS and CONTRAINDICATIONS. Should be placed in a table for easy reading. 3, SURGICAL TECHNIQUES. Should describe how to reconstruct both endocrine and exocrine drainage. Regarding exocrine drainage, the history, surgical methods, advantages, and disadvantages should be listed in detailed.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation Manuscript NO: 86645 Title: Simultaneous pancreas-kidney transplantation for end-stage renal failure in Type 1 diabetes Mellitus: Current perspectives Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed Peer-review model: Single blind Reviewer's code: 02524651 **Position:** Peer Reviewer Academic degree: MD Professional title: Professor Reviewer's Country/Territory: China Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-30 Reviewer chosen by: Ji-Hong Liu Reviewer accepted review: 2023-08-02 04:05 Reviewer performed review: 2023-08-03 03:46

Review time: 23 Hours

Scientific quality	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [] Grade C: Good [] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	 [] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [] Major revision [] Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous



statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please introduce the surgical techniques of enteric drainage, and describe the current status.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation Manuscript NO: 86645 Title: Simultaneous pancreas-kidney transplantation for end-stage renal failure in Type 1 diabetes Mellitus: Current perspectives Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed Peer-review model: Single blind **Reviewer's code:** 03546647 **Position:** Peer Reviewer Academic degree: MD, PhD Professional title: Assistant Professor, Surgeon Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-30 Reviewer chosen by: Ji-Hong Liu Reviewer accepted review: 2023-08-04 10:44 Reviewer performed review: 2023-08-04 10:58

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	 [] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [] Major revision [] Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous



statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors were able to address most of the comments.