



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 86887

Title: Dietary salt in liver cirrhosis: with a pinch of salt!

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03259131

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-07-12

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-08-01 02:27

Reviewer performed review: 2023-08-02 09:16

Review time: 1 Day and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review comments World Journal of Hepatology review of Manuscript NO86887_reviewer. It is my great honour and pleasure to review such an interesting manuscript. The authors tried to disclose that the measurement of salt consumption and compliance with salt guidelines are both problematic. There is insufficient evidence to say whether salt intake should be restricted in patients with compensated cirrhosis and liberalised in those with severe hyponatremia. Moreover, salt restriction guidelines do not take into account the salt sensitivity, nutritional state, volume status, condition of third compartment storage sites of patients, and the risk of hyponatremia. This is a narrative review. Could you show the turning point of salt management for liver cirrhosis? Innovation, or new drug emergence? The readers want to know. This topic is interesting and important. The present manuscript will be recommended for the publication of "World Journal of Hepatology".

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 86887

Title: Dietary salt in liver cirrhosis: with a pinch of salt!

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03668558

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-07-12

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-08-30 05:50

Reviewer performed review: 2023-09-01 12:50

Review time: 2 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This was a review on pros and cons of a low-salt diet in patients with cirrhosis. The paper describes the current evidence about this issue, highlighting how a restricted salt diet could be detrimental rather than beneficial in such patients, especially during decompensated disease. The paper summarizes already known concepts, although in an interesting way. The title is nice. I suggest to modify the abstract, which has many typos and does not send the actual message of the paper. I agree with most of consideration and hypothesis made by the Authors on the role of salt restricted diet in cirrhosis. I think, however, that several points may be added/discussed. - first, there is an interplay between low-salt diet, daily water intake, diuretics. Salt restricted diet is not the only therapy to be used in patients with cirrhosis and portal hypertension. This point should be discussed, in my opinion - second, there are different disease stages, as described in the section on patients with compensated cirrhosis. In the first part of the manuscript, it seems that a salt restricted diet should be useful to treat ascites and should be considered only in such patients (with ascites of any degree? With refractory ascites?). I suggest, therefore, to specify when patients should be counselled against high

salt diet or a low salt diet. - Third, I agree with the Authors when they said that it is very difficult for a patient to measure his/her daily salt intake. Natriuresis may be useful, but it can be influenced also by loop diuretics. I suggest to add a table which can provide useful information that the Reader can deliver to his/her patients (what type(s) of food can be avoided? What measures can be applied in order to make food palatable even without high amount of salt?) - Fourth, I agree with the Authors when they say that hypoNa is often associated with hypervolemia. However, there are also other causes of hypoNa, as high dose of diuretics, that should be kept in mind. - The Authors said that salt restriction should be advised in patients with compensated cirrhosis and CSPH. This point should be better explained. Indeed, is there a role about salt restriction for other features of decompensated cirrhosis as HE or variceal bleeding?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 86887

Title: Dietary salt in liver cirrhosis: with a pinch of salt!

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02617544

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-07-12

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-08-28 10:38

Reviewer performed review: 2023-09-08 16:02

Review time: 11 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Hepatic cirrhosis is a chronic disease defined with hepatocytes necrosis and fibrosis in which nutrition and salt intakes play a crucial role. The main aim of this paper is to critically analyse the existing literature (conflicting data) with regards to salt intake and recommendations for patients with liver cirrhosis. Overall, this review is very interesting and well written. I have just the following minor comments: 1: In some passages, the authors talk about salt (Salt intake or consumption, high-salt intake, salt restriction), while in others, they focus more on "sodium" (Sodium intake, Sodium balance, Na excretion, Na retention, Na balance etc...), this may seem obvious to some, but confusing for others (non-experts in the field). Therefore, it would be important to add a few sentences in order to clearly explain to the "novice" reader the importance of sodium, per se, in the salt recommendations for patients. Also, given that (as indicated by the authors, page 6) the serum chloride concentration is also very important, what would be the role of "chloride", per se, in all this? 2: Several errors and/or typos need to be corrected...For example, in the abstract: "Mainatance" , "recomenedations" , Etc. The whole manuscript needs to be revised in a more careful manner.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 86887

Title: Dietary salt in liver cirrhosis: With a pinch of salt!

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03668558

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-07-12

Reviewer chosen by: Ji-Hong Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-09-24 06:32

Reviewer performed review: 2023-09-24 06:36

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest the revised version of this manuscript. The Authors fairly answered my previous comments. I think that the manuscript has been improved after this review round