

Ms: ESPS Manuscript NO: 11309

Authors: Saleh A. Naser, Almatmed Abdelsalam, Saisathya Thanigachalam, Abed S. Naser, Kaye Alcedo

Title: The domino effect of hypomagnesemia on the innate immunity of Crohn's disease patients

Reviewer: 2526196

GENERAL COMMENTS:

This is a good review. In this review, authors focus on the effect of deficiency of magnesium on Crohn's disease (CD). First authors outline the inflammations in CD including both innate and adaptive immune responses. Then authors in more detail mention about magnesium including its homeostasis, role in the inflammation, anti- proinflammatory cytokine effect, effect on NMDA receptor, relation with C reactive protein, losing in CD and effect on CD, etc. Therefore the review is good for the readership related to gastrointestinal (GI) field and the journals related to GI function and diseases. However, this review is planned to submit to WJD. I think it is better to submitted to the journals related to GI tract, such as WJG rather than WJD. In another word this review is not so suitable for readership of WJD. REPLY: WJD invited the corresponding author Dr. Naser to contribute manuscripts to the journal who is specialized in IBD and recently pursued interest in Type I Diabetes. The role of Magnesium on digestive diseases including Pancreas is well noted. It is important that WJD to be inclusive of quality manuscripts just Like the Lancet, Nature, PNAS and others. I see great benefits in making the the new journal more inclusive to encourage more readers to follow the journal and potentially contribute manuscripts. As editor in chief for WJG, I believe my views are based on long term vision for promoting new this new journal.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS:

Title: The title and running title are well to reflect the major topic and contents of this review.

Abstract: This abstract should be written better. Authors should mainly summary the effects of hypomagnesemia on CD, not just mention the aims of the review. Through reading the abstract, authors should understand the main contents of the review. REPLY: revised

Core tip: It is very well written.

INTRODUCTION: The introduction is little bit long, but it is ok written. However it will be better if the introduction is involved in more detail to outline the CD rather than the UC. REPLY: revised

Main text of the review:

There are many subtitles of main text, some with a lot contents but some only with several lines of description. It should organize in more logical ways and some subtitles can be combined into one subtitle. Furthermore, some subtitles should belong to sub-subtitles of one subtitle, for example subtitles of MAGNESIUM AS AN ANTI-PROINFLAMMATORY CYTOKINE; OXIDATIVE

STRESS AND MAGNESIUM; MAGNESIUM EFFECT ON NMDA RECEPTORS; MAGNESIUM, GUT MICROBIOTA AND INTESTINAL PERMEABILITY and MAGNESIUM, GUT MICROBIOTA AND INTESTINAL PERMEABILITY are sub-subtitles of subtitle of ROLE OF MAGNESIUM IN INFLAMMATION. Reply: Subtitles help readers to digest information better instead of long paragraphs. The suggestion is good and we revised it accordingly.

Another suggestion: If it is possible, using more tables to summary the contents of main text of the review may be better for the readers to understand the review. REPLY: We have included three tables and a figure that sums the review.

Conclusion: It is well written.

References: The format of references meet request by WJD and the references are up-dated.

Tables: Table 1 and Table 2 are ok, but Table 3 should be corrected to standard three lines table. REPLY: corrected

CLASSIFICATION OF THE MANUSCRIPT
grades B.

LANGUAGE EVALUATION
Grade B

Reviewed by 02638867

Authors suggested that this review highlights some of the well-known functions of magnesium and their potential rule in shaping CD activity. It was strongly suggested by data that magnesium could play a significant rule in controlling CD. This review is well written, so it should be able to published asap.

CLASSIFICATION OF THE MANUSCRIPT
grades A.

LANGUAGE EVALUATION
Grade A

Sincere thanks to editor, the staff and the reviewers for making the process enjoyable.