

Format for ANSWERING REVIEWERS



September 30, 2014

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 13271-review.doc).

Title: Factors associated with hopelessness in epileptic patients

Authors: Maurizio Pompili, Gianluca Serafini, Marco Innamorati, Franco Montebovi, Dorian A Lamis, Mariantonietta Milelli, Manuela Giuliani, Matteo Caporro, Paolo Tisei, David Lester, Mario Amore, Carla Buttinelli, Paolo Girardi

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Psychiatry*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 13271

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

Referee 1

Comments To Authors

This is a very well written article and the study is of interest to researchers in the field of hopelessness, hardiness, epilepsy, suicidal ideation, and depression. I found the table were very logical and the statistical approach was very straightforward and easy to follow.

Question 1. My only suggestion is to read through the article one more time because there are some little wording problems with "an" "the" etc. For example, on page 13, there is a misspelled word -- "indentifyng".

Answer to Question 1. Thank you for this suggestion. The manuscript has been carefully revised by a native English speaker for the quality of language and all the mentioned typos have now been corrected.

Question 2. Also, the discussion is a little long and rambling...if there is a way to tighten up some, that would help the reader out.

Answer to Question 2. The discussion has now been completely revised and a specific Limitations section has been included to the revised version of the paper. Overall, the total length of the Discussion section has been reduced from the initial 1595 to 921 total words (without Limitations section).

Classification Grade B (Very good)

Language evaluation Grade B: minor language polishing

Conclusion Accept

Referee 2

Comments To Authors

The authors report the data from a study aimed to evaluate risk factors associated with hopelessness, in two groups of patients with epilepsy: a group of patients with generalized tonic-clonic epilepsy and a group of patients with with partial epilepsy. The authors conclude that patients with generalized seizures report more limitations in common social/role activities due to emotional problems compared to patients with other types of seizures. The manuscript is well-written, interesting and useful for the physicians.

Question 1. In the Discussion, I suggest to add a small statement about the limitations of the study: in particular, the two groups of patients are not similar and the lack of an healthy control group.

Answer to Question 1. Thank you very much for this suggestion. The main limitations of the present findings have been clearly described within a specific section. We also reported that in the present study the two groups of patients are not similar and that an healthy control group is lacking accordingly.

The main text has been modified as follows:

“Furthermore, the two groups of patients (those affected by epilepsy with generalized tonic-clonic seizures *vs.* those having epilepsy with partial seizures) are not similar and an healthy control group was not available.”

Classification Grade A ((Excellent))

Language evaluation Grade B: minor language polishing

Conclusion Minor Revision

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Sincerely,

Maurizio Pompili M.D.; Ph.D. (for all authors)