January 12, 2015

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 15084-review.doc).

Title: Dento-maxillofacial Radiology as a Specialty

Author: Kıvanç Kamburoğlu

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 15084

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing my manuscript in the World Journal of Radiology.

Sincerely yours,

Kıvanç Kamburoğ L. DDS, MSc, PhD, Associate Professor, Department of Dentomaxillofacial Radiology, Faculty of Dentistry, Ankara University, Ankara, Turkey. dtkivo@yahoo.com

The purpose of an editorial is to give a leading statement of the journal viewpoint. A good editorial would give evidence and explain its position regarding the issue it writes about. ==========

Minor comments: The manuscripts lists some 15-17 techniques in its leading statement. There is barely any explanation of what the techniques are, no argument of why they are of relevance, no explanation of why dental maxillofacial radiology should be considered as a separate specialty. Five of the techniques are somewhat discussed, with only some descriptive hints. The 10-12 other techniques, from cephalometric imaging to terahertz imaging, through MSCT, PET, nuclear imaging, computer aided, image guided procedures, etc, are discarded.

======== Major comments: 1) It is unclear what readership the manuscript intends to reach. - If the manuscript addresses non-specialist readers: the content is cryptic. - If the manuscript intends to address trainees or maxillofacial surgeon or dentists: the content is barely informative. Keywords abound without evidence based information for decision learning. - If the manuscript's intended readers are dental maxillofacial radiologists: what does it provide that the radiologist doesn't already know? - If the message is to argue dental maxillofacial radiology as a specific specialty (with or without nuclear imaging???), a balanced discussion should be provided. 2) Self-citation is a necessity when one's work is a leading discovery, contributes high level of evidence in a research domain. Typically a research paper would contain no more than 1 or 2 self-citations, or 5-10% of the references. In the current manuscript, 5 of 7 references, 71%, are self-citations without compelling reason. Excess can be frowned upon.

======= Suggestion: This reviewer's suggestion is to rewrite the paper, to provide arguments why a hospital should invest into the creation of a dental maxillofacial radiology department, provide arguments why the authors consider that a general radiology or a general imaging department cannot handle the dental maxillofacial requirements. If particular techniques are considered priorities, indepth discussion should be given.

Owing to its unique anatomy, structures and pathologies, the dentomaxillofacial region needs specific considerations during diagnostic imaging. Therefore, acceptance of dentomaxillofacial radiology as a different speciality is very important in terms of diagnostic and clinical sciences.

Only routinely utilized and clinically important techniques are discussed in this editorial.

Self citations were given becasue they were from World Journal of Radiology and this could help to enhance journals impact.

Authors thank reviewers for their constructive comments.