

Response to reviewer's comments:

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO.: 22962

Column: Review

Title: Curcumin as a potential therapeutic candidate for *Helicobacter pylori* associated diseases

Authors: Avijit Sarkar, Ronita De and Asish Kumar Mukhopadhyay

Reviewer's code: 02527808

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 15:40

Date reviewed: 2015-11-10 09:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is novel one as regarding the use of natural plants in the ttt of various diseases, the article is comprehensive one well written but some issues must be raised. The drug showed less effectiveness when compared with the traditional ttt when conducted on small group of patients due to low solubility, poor absorption and less bioavailability. So the curcumin is not specific for *H. pylori* & can be used in different other GIT disorder. So it is earlier to think that it is a therapeutic candidate for ttt of *H. pylori*. Other minor issues the manuscript & references is very long must be summarized.

RESPONSE:

Thank you for your comments that you find our article "novel...comprehensive one and well written". We are in agreement with you that it is too early to say curcumin as therapeutic option against *H. pylori*. Although curcumin showed higher efficacy than triple therapy in normalization of some molecules (e.g. MMP-3, MMP-9 etc.), due to its low solubility, poor absorption and less bioavailability, it cannot be considered as a drug against *H. pylori* infection **in its native form**. But results of several groups made us believe on the anti-*H. pylori* potential of curcumin. We have discussed what is present in the literature still now, be it favoring the issue or its limitations. We have incorporated curcumin's potential as anti-*H. pylori* molecule, criticisms regarding the bioavailability issue and possible options for modified product which can be tested for its anti-*H. pylori* effect with a hope to emerge as a therapeutic option against *H. pylori* induced gastric complications.

The revised manuscript is summarized to focus curcumin's anti-*H. pylori* effect. According to your suggestion we have decreased the number of references.

Reviewer's code: 00503464

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 15:40

Date reviewed:2015-11-25 01:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review paper, the author summarized the effect of curcumin on *Helicobacter pylori* associated symptoms. The attempt is interesting, but a scarce evidence make this manuscript not being worth reading.comment1. The manuscript is way too long. The author should focus on the effect of curcumin on *Helicobacter pylori* associated symptoms. The general description as to the effect of curcumin should be shortened.

RESPONSE:

Evidence of Anti-*H. pylori* effect has been summarized in the Table 1. According to your suggestion, revised manuscript has now been focused on the *Helicobacter pylori* associated symptoms. Now, we have shortened the general description (Introduction, different properties of curcumin and role in gastroduodenal diseases) of curcumin.

Reviewer's code: 01047630

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 15:40

Date reviewed:2015-11-26 18:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review article for curcumin in the potential anti-*H. pylori* effect. The authors summarized the previous data well and so this will give readers a good useful information.(Major comments)1. There are too many contents in this manuscript. During reading this manuscript, the readers will lose the original object of this manuscript. Therefore, the content should be shortened and the content should be focused on the anti-*H. pylori* effect.2. In this manuscript, there are many abbreviations used. The use of these abbreviations is not correct.3. There are many grammar errors in this manuscript.4. If possible, please add the figure showing the mechanism of anti-*H. pylori* effect of curcumin.

RESPONSE:

Thank you that you classified our review as "Very Good" and found useful information. According to your suggestion we have decreased the contents of the review in the revised manuscript. We have shortened the general description (Introduction, different properties of curcumin and role in gastroduodenal diseases) of curcumin and now revised manuscript is focused on curcumin's anti-*H. pylori* effect.

2. In the revised manuscript we have included full form of the abbreviations when they first appeared. Now we have only kept commonly used abbreviation (e.g. NF- κ B, COX-2, IFN- γ , TNF- α etc.) after introducing their full form.

3. Grammatical errors have been corrected throughout the manuscript.

4. Thank you for your suggestion. Mechanism of anti-*H. pylori* effect of curcumin is still elusive. Literature only showed direct anti-*H. pylori* effect of curcumin in different strains. Till date what researchers have found are effect of *H. pylori* in cell lines or gastric mucosa (changes of cytokines profile and signaling molecules) and only reversal upon treatment with curcumin. Accordingly in the revised manuscript we have incorporated a schematic diagram (Figure 2) showing the role of curcumin in *H. pylori* infection.

Reviewer's code: 00183445

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 15:40

Date reviewed:2015-12-04 00:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is focusing on curcumin obtained from *Curcuma longa* as anti-*Helicobacter pylori* agent. The Authors describe different models for studying anti-oxidative, anti-inflammatory and anti-carcinogenic effects of curcumin. All aspects of curcumin activity against *H. pylori* bacteria as well as the effects related to infection have been discussed. The article contains also criticisms about the limitations for using of curcumin. This manuscript is very valuable and well written.

RESPONSE:

Thank you for your positive comments. We are very happy that you found our article valuable and well written.