

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 31030

Title: Protein tolerance to standard and high protein meals in patients with liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 01805500

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-31

Date reviewed: 2016-11-01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The role of protein overload in determining HE is challenged by some observations showing that hyperammonemia is not due to diet but shunts, i.e., Blood ammonia levels in liver cirrhosis: a clue for the presence of portosystemic collateral veins....published in WJG. Authors should add this point to reinforce their findings.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 31030

Title: Protein tolerance to standard and high protein meals in patients with liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02861208

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-31

Date reviewed: 2016-11-02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study that evaluated the changes in levels of aminoacids after ingestion of protein. The manuscript is well-structured, the rationale behind the study is clear, and the results are relevant for the field of nutrition in liver disease. It has been shown before that normal and high protein diets are safe for cirrhotic patients and do not lead to encephalopathy; however this study adds information regarding the actual absorption and changes in plasmatic levels of each of the aminoacids. I believe this is an important study, it takes into account the already established guidelines that support high protein diets and that have been shown to improve nutritional status in patients with cirrhosis and goes further into the dynamics of absorption of the amino acids, and although it would be interesting to see the effect 1.2-1.5g/kg on the plasma levels, the study is good enough as it is. I suggest minor changes to this manuscript; the authors mention "uncompensated cirrhosis", which should be changed to decompensated cirrhosis. I also suggest editing the figures, because the quality is not good enough for



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

publication.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 31030

Title: Protein tolerance to standard and high protein meals in patients with liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02540430

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-31

Date reviewed: 2016-11-07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written manuscript addressing liver cirrhosis. Minor grammar or spelling changes are suggested in the manuscript.