

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31519

Title: Anterolateral rotatory instability in vivo correlates tunnel position after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction using bone-patellar tendon-bone graft

Reviewer's code: 00364821

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-23 15:30

Date reviewed: 2016-12-01 22:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article by Yasutaka and colleagues clarified in vivo rotatory knee stability as well as the anterior-posterior stability after ACL reconstruction using BTB autografts, and correlate knee stability to tunnel positions. It suggested that Anterolateral rotatory instability significantly correlated shallow femoral tunnel positions after ACL reconstruction using BTB autografts. Clinical outcomes, rotatory and anterior-posterior stability were overall satisfactory in both techniques, but the trans-tibial technique located femoral tunnels in shallower and higher positions, and tibial tunnels in more posterior positions than the trans-portal technique, thus increased the anterolateral rotation. Anatomic ACL reconstruction with BTB autografts may restore knee function and stability. The conclusion can offer some valuable guidances to the clinical practice. The content is clear and definite, level of structure is logical and accurate. The manuscript is well-written. There are, however, a few minor issues that should be addressed. 1. Is there any statistic difference of the basic information (such as the age, weight, height, etc) in the two groups? Please describe it clearly in the article. 2. Although recent large cohort studies have reported gender is not a risk factor for knee instability or revision



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

after ACL reconstruction, it is appreciated to add female research so that the conclusion may be more reliable.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31519

Title: Anterolateral rotatory instability in vivo correlates tunnel position after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction using bone-patellar tendon-bone graft

Reviewer's code: 00737959

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-23 15:30

Date reviewed: 2017-01-11 23:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The open MRI plus Slocum ATRI test is a good method for quantitative assessment of rotatory stability of the knee. But we need reliable data to evaluate the result. 1. The demographics of two groups were not presented and compared. 2. The sample size was not large enough as mentioned in the article. 3. Why didn't you do this research on the patients undergoing ACL reconstruction with hamstrings since the sample size would be larger than that using BPB as implied in your article. 4. There are many language flaws in the article.