

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 32710

Title: A Historical Perspective of Cell Transplantation in Parkinson's disease

Reviewer's code: 00504800

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2017-02-11

Date reviewed: 2017-03-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written and informative; I can say that as a non-neuroscientist I actually enjoyed reading this manuscript and learned quite a bit from it. The only question that I would like the authors to consider is that of the lifespan or durability of the engrafted cells. Most of the studies cited show that engrafted cells improve function for only a limited period of time. It is unclear to me if this is because the animals were not observed for an extended period, or because the engrafted cells died, became senescent, lost function, etc. I would ask the authors to consider adding a paragraph to "Section V: General Discussion" to address cell viability and durability, and express an opinion for last-lasting symptom control in PD animals/patients.