



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 33154

**Title:** Liquid biopsy in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma: Circulating tumor cells and cell-free nucleic acids

**Reviewer's code:** 03656580

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-02-08

**Date reviewed:** 2017-02-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors have reviewed the available literature on CTCs and cfNAs in patients with HCC, and discuss future perspectives in this field in detail, including the histological backgrounds, characteristics, and developments of CTCs and cfNAs in cancer research and discuss future perspectives, with a specific focus on HCC.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 33154

**Title:** Liquid biopsy in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma: Circulating tumor cells and cell-free nucleic acids

**Reviewer's code:** 01806467

**Reviewer's country:** South Korea

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-02-08

**Date reviewed:** 2017-02-24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-integrated review paper from Okajima and Komatsu et al describing the role of "liquid biopsy" in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). This is a topic of increasing interest hence the timing and the article is of interest. There are some areas where I would like to mention. - Theoretically, circulating tumor cells (CTCs) are useful markers for early diagnosis; however, the problem is that the earlier the stage is, the less the cells are (tends to be proportional to tumor volume). In addition, less than 0.01% of CTCs introduced into the circulation survive to produce metastases. Therefore, the performance (sensitivity and specificity) of detection technique should be achieved to a proper level. This should be clearly mentioned in the manuscript. - To divide "CTC detection in patients with HCC and its clinical relevance" into two section: 1) biological method and 2) physical method would make the manuscript more readable. - Epithelial-to-mesenchymal transition (EMT) need not be explained in detail in the Introduction (page 6). It is sufficient to mention EMT in the paragraph that describes



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

biological method; because EMT alone is not a good marker for CTC detection considering the heterogeneity of tumor. - Please provide more explanation about multiple filters (page 7) and CTC-Chip platform (page 12). - Cell free nucleic acid part is generally okay but a little bit lengthy; it could be shortened. - Relevant references are missing in the Introduction section.