

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34037

Title: Clinical Outcomes of Isolated Renal Failure Compared to Other Forms of Organ Failure in Patients with Severe Acute Pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00037018

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-03-28

Date reviewed: 2017-03-31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This interesting article studies the association between subtypes of organ failure outcomes after acute pancreatitis in a large cohort of patients from a tertiary hospital. The drug is well written and performed. The major missing information are results from a sound multivariate analysis, since many covariates are associated with organ failure subtypes in this cohort. Could the authors attempt such multivariate approaches using for example multilinear regression or classification and regression trees? Moreover, it seems that very few cases of pancreatitis in their cohort are due to drugs. Could the authors comment on this?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34037

Title: Clinical Outcomes of Isolated Renal Failure Compared to Other Forms of Organ Failure in Patients with Severe Acute Pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 03699976

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-03-28

Date reviewed: 2017-04-11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluate the clinical outcomes of severe acute pancreatitis patients with isolated renal failure using the prospectively enrolled cohort data of acute pancreatitis patients. This manuscript is written well, and the authors properly discuss based on the results. However, I have a comment about conclusion of this study. Based on the comparison between isolated renal failure and isolated respiratory failure group, the authors conclude that isolated renal failure group has a better prognosis compared to isolated respiratory failure group from the result that patients with isolated renal failure were significantly less likely to require ICU admission (59% vs. 100%) and had shorter mean ICU stay (2.4 vs. 15.7 days), compared to patients with isolated respiratory failure. However, as mentioned in the Discussion section, these are thought to be only due to the need for mechanical ventilation. Therefore, the conclusion that isolated renal failure group has a better prognosis than isolated respiratory failure group is exaggerated. The authors should tone down the opinion.