



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

Manuscript NO: 34150

Title: Atypical manifestation of herpes esophagitis in an immunocompetent patient: Case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 00506495

Reviewer's country: Israel

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-03-31

Date reviewed: 2017-04-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. This is an interesting case report worth publishing. 2. Correct typo: herbal medications. 3. Define CMV and PCR when first mentioned. 4. I think some further discussion other than the route of infection, which is mentioned by the authors, or hypothesis as to why in this immunocompetent patient or in general why in some immunocompetent patients the immune system fails to protect the host from HSV infection or manifestation, should be added to the Discussion section.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

Manuscript NO: 34150

Title: Atypical manifestation of herpes esophagitis in an immunocompetent patient: Case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 00506481

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-04-14

Date reviewed: 2017-04-22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have presented the Case report and literature review of an atypical manifestation of herpes esophagitis in an immunocompetent patient citing this as a unique case of HSV esophagitis in a healthy male, without any immunocompromising conditions or significant comorbidities. IT IS VERY WELL DESCRIBED AND DESERVES TO BE SHARED WITH THE SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY FOR THE FOLLOWING POINTS: The case highlights the importance of keeping HSV esophagitis as one of the differential diagnosis for immunocompetent patients who present with symptoms suggestive of esophagitis. HSV is a known causative of esophagitis in the immunocompromised but its presentation in healthy patients without any significant comorbidity is uncommon. This is a unique case where the presentation of HSV esophagitis is associated with a systemic viral prodrome.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

Manuscript NO: 34150

Title: Atypical manifestation of herpes esophagitis in an immunocompetent patient: Case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 00506608

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-04-14

Date reviewed: 2017-05-06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall, I found this manuscript very well written, organized, and informative - it presents an interesting case and a nice summary review of the topic. The topic is interesting and the discussion will be of interest to readers. My only question - given the patient's presentation, after the diagnosis was made - and consistent with their discussion - why did they not start with IV therapy and move to Oral therapy vs going right to oral therapy. This is only a minor thought and should not distract from an excellent overall manuscript.