

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34256

Title: Gender-dependent difference in the effect of metformin on colorectal cancer-specific mortality of diabetic colorectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 02569164

Reviewer's country: United Arab Emirates

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-04-20

Date reviewed: 2017-04-28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article by Park JW et al. "Gender-dependent effect of metformin in colorectal cancer-..." address the factors associated with the effect of metformin on mortality in diabetic colorectal cancer patients. They performed retrospective study of 413 patients diagnosed with both stage 3/4 CRC and diabetes mellitus in the period between January 2000 and December 2010. There were no significant interactions between metformin and almost all factors analysed on colorectal cancer-specific mortality safe a beneficial effect in female gender who showed lower CRC-specific mortality rate. This simple observation could be of interest but it remain preliminary. Eventhough the authors have tried to explain and support the findings in the discussion, it might be more interesting if this finding could be confirmed by additional/multiple approaches, such as animal experiment for example. Other comments: 1- Define the abbreviations in the abstract and text 2- the "aim" needs to be clarified 3- the language needs revisions and polishing 4- the core tip is not written properly - the core tip is not the authors names! - it should



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

have been written properly or left blank.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34256

Title: Gender-dependent difference in the effect of metformin on colorectal cancer-specific mortality of diabetic colorectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 03656606

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-01

Date reviewed: 2017-05-05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript tried to assess factors associated with the effect of metformin on mortality in diabetic CRC patients. Demographics and clinical characteristics of 413 patients with both CRC and DM were analyzed. The results showed that female CRC patients taking metformin exhibited a significantly lower CRC-specific mortality rate than male CRC patients taking metformin. Further analysis revealed significant differences in CRC-specific mortality between the metformin and non-metformin groups in female patients but not male patients. The present study showed a strong gender-dependent difference in the effect of metformin on CRC-specific mortality in advanced stage CRC patients with diabetes. Identifying subgroup patients who benefit from metformin treatment is important for further study in this field and this manuscript provided interesting and valuable findings.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34256

Title: Gender-dependent difference in the effect of metformin on colorectal cancer-specific mortality of diabetic colorectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 00503243

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-01

Date reviewed: 2017-05-07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent manuscript, well conducted and well written on an interesting topic as the effect of metformin on CRC. I congratulate with the authors and do not have any comment.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34256

Title: Gender-dependent difference in the effect of metformin on colorectal cancer-specific mortality of diabetic colorectal cancer patients

Reviewer's code: 02441161

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-01

Date reviewed: 2017-05-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very good retrospective cohort study.