



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34445

Title: Ketogenic diet imposes significant effect on imbalanced gut microbiota in infants with refractory epilepsy

Reviewer's code: 00685143

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-05-04

Date reviewed: 2017-05-15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important study in regards to refractory epilepsy in pediatric patients correlating GM-changes to seizure frequency after KD and compared to controls. However, while this may provide a foundation for future research, I believe more of that future research needs to be currently added before this study can be more groundbreaking--eg. demonstrate a benefit in a refractory epilepsy patient by changing the GM to that of normal control independent of KD (such as with fecal transplant or antibiotic therapy), or show and on-off-on correlation with KD and GM.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34445

Title: Ketogenic diet imposes significant effect on imbalanced gut microbiota in infants with refractory epilepsy

Reviewer’s code: 02439990

Reviewer’s country: France

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-05-17

Date reviewed: 2017-05-23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report for the first time that gut microbiota from epileptic infants differ significantly from that of healthy patients and that the ketogenic diet, even after one week, can alter the composition of gut microbiota. The study is interesting and deserves to be repeated after a longer period of the ketogenic diet to obtain more significant results. Minor concerns: - Abstract Results, last line: What did the authors mean by: “ kept continued to increase” in the study context? Material and Methods Please give the composition of the ketogenic diet Results Please, give statistical data for the Shannon index and PCA Table 1 and supplementary Table 3 are partially redundant and could be grouped. Sampling date can be removed and replaced with the medical treatment. The statistical differences concerning age and gender can be given in the text. The word “effective” is not clear. The reader must understand that the improvement of clinical symptoms results from the effect of the ketogenic diet.