

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34471

Title: Clinical features of gastric mucosa-associated lymphoid tissue (MALT) lymphoma in patients with extra copies of MALT1

Reviewer's code: 00506058

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-22

Date reviewed: 2017-05-25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer report Manuscript title : "Clinical features of gastric mucosa-associated lymphoid tissue (MALT) lymphoma in patients with extra copies of MALT1" In this multi-centered, retrospective study, the authors reviewed 146 patients with MALT lymphoma in the stomach who underwent fluorescence in situ hybridization analysis for t(11;18) translocation. Patients with gastric MALT lymphoma without t(11;18) translocation or extra copies of MALT1 or those with extra copies of MALT1 showed similar clinical characteristics and responded to Helicobacter pylori eradication. The study is well designed and the findings are significant.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34471

Title: Clinical features of gastric mucosa-associated lymphoid tissue (MALT) lymphoma in patients with extra copies of MALT1

Reviewer's code: 00477066

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-22

Date reviewed: 2017-06-03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting well-designed multi center study on the role of MALT1 in MALT lymphoma. The conclusion can be supported by the results. It can add something interest to current knowledge. However minor revision are needed. The title should be modified to "management of gastric mucosa-associated lymphoid tissue (MALT) lymphoma in patients with extra copies of MALT1". The Figure 2 is not so Clea and thus has to be modified in more suitable graphic version. Being a retrospective study the conclusion should be more cautious and a call to further studies should be advocated to give definitive conclusion.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34471

Title: Clinical features of gastric mucosa-associated lymphoid tissue (MALT) lymphoma in patients with extra copies of MALT1

Reviewer's code: 00058696

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-22

Date reviewed: 2017-06-05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This new manuscript has been carefully reviewed.

There are some minor questions that are listed below:

1) INTRODUCTION: Prior to "The purpose of this study", authors should state their hypothesis.

2) RESULTS: paragraph 2. The authors need to specifically state whether the endoscopic appearance was of any benefit in helping to distinguishing the three groups of patients that are being studied in this manuscript.

3) In RESULTS, it was not entirely clear whether eradication of H. pylori was confirmed in all of the antibiotic treated patients. How was the presence of H. pylori excluded in the patients in Group B?



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

- 4) What issues do the authors believe need to be examined in future studies?