

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34902

Title: Evaluation of the Relationship Between Hepatocellular Carcinoma Location and Transarterial Chemoembolization Efficacy

Reviewer's code: 03656588

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-06-07

Date reviewed: 2017-06-08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) In this retrospective study, the authors evaluated the relationship between the location of the HCC (in particular, the location close to the peripheral or hepatic portal portion of the liver) and the efficacy of TACE. It is an interesting study on TACE for HCC. 2) The results demonstrated that a significant difference between the location of HCC and efficacy of TACE existed only in the Child-Pugh grade A patients. When HCC is located in the peripheral area in the right lobe or medial segment, TACE is much more suitable for treatment. when HCC is located in the central area in the right lobe or medial segment, an early combination of local ablation therapy (such as radiofrequency ablation and percutaneous ethanol injection) with TACE may be efficacious. It is very important guidance for clinical doctors to select the TACE for HCC. 3) But there were very few HCC nodules in the caudate lobe in the study , it need further supplemental data and compare the location of HCC and efficacy of TACE in the caudate lobe. 4) I suggest that

the manuscript can be published in the form of retrospective study in World J Gastroenterology after data are supplemented.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34902

Title: Evaluation of the Relationship Between Hepatocellular Carcinoma Location and Transarterial Chemoembolization Efficacy

Reviewer's code: 02527808

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-06-07

Date reviewed: 2017-06-12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[] The same title	[Y] High priority for publication
[] Grade C: Good	[] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[] Duplicate publication	[] Rejection
[] Grade D: Fair	[] Grade D: Rejected	[Y] No	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	[] Major revision
		[] The same title	
		[] Duplicate publication	
		[] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study is interesting as regard the evaluation of the relationship between the location of hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) and efficacy of transarterial chemoembolization (TACE) .as those critically ill patients need right option for treatment. But the main defect is the small number of cases in the subgroups below statistical significance as in table 2. Language editing is needed as spacing between words need revision e.g group,withno significant difference inthe lateral segment. In Child-Pugh B, median location ratio of HCC in each lobe and segment was not significantly different between the two groups. Therefore,improved TACE efficacy maybe obtained for HCC in the peripheral zone of the right lobe and medial segment in Child-Pugh A patients.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34902

Title: Evaluation of the Relationship Between Hepatocellular Carcinoma Location and Transarterial Chemoembolization Efficacy

Reviewer's code: 02530754

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-06-07

Date reviewed: 2017-06-22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Miki et al is a retrospective analysis which analyzed the influence of HCC location on tumor radiological response after TACE. The manuscript is informative and provides interesting insights. The authors are kindly invited to consider the following recommendations: 1- Please clarify whether the concept of "HCC location ratio" is empirically proposed by the authors, or has been validated in previous studies. In the latter scenario, please provide references. 2- Conventionally, p values <0.001 are presented as such. Please avoid expressions like "7.5x10⁻⁵" (see for instance line 13 in the abstract). 3- Among the inclusion criteria, the following can be read: "MDCT or MRI performed before TACE and at least 6 months after TACE". Does it mean that the interval between TACE and evaluation of radiological response varied among the included patients? 4- The authors state that "the median recurrence time was 2 months", but evaluation of radiological response was performed from 6 months

onwards. If a radiological surveillance was protocolized earlier after TACE, it should be described in methods. 5- Some demographic features are displayed in methods. Please, move this information to the results' section. 6- The term "ratio" in epidemiology is a time-dependent concept, which may be cause misunderstanding in the present paper. I would recommend using "location coefficient" instead of "location ratio". 7- Although the reader may be able to infer that an increased location ratio actually refer to a more peripheral nodule, I would recommend to specify this information in methods to avoid confusion. 8- The potential role of HCC imaging and histological features as potential confounding factors in the present study is unclear. Are those tumors with increased location coefficient also more advanced, less differentiated or associate microvascular invasion more frequently? In order to clarify this important caveat, I would recommend the authors to run a multivariate logistic regression analysis including tumor features, location coefficient and Child-Pugh status. These new results would greatly increase the strength of the evidence. 9- The manuscript would benefit from minor English polishing. 10- In table 3, please provide standard deviations for location coefficient values. In addition, p values should be corrected as stated above in comment number 2.