

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35465

Title: Pretransplantation Fetal-Maternal Microchimerism in Pediatric Liver Transplantation from Mother

Reviewer's code: 00058381

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-07-20

Date reviewed: 2017-07-21

Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major Comment: Important limitations of this study (in terms of both technical issues and patient numbers) are mentioned by the authors and will not be changeable by revision. Minor Comments: Table 1 (last line) obviously requires correction. Discussion (pages 15/16): "In this reason, we could not show the each beneficial impact of NIMA-MC positivity and same HLA-DR on rejection-free survival rate, as shown in Table 2." - Please improve this sentence. Results (page 12): "Rejection activity index were variable from 3 to 5; one was RAI 5 and the other 4 recipients were RAI 3." - Please rectify this sentence (plural of "index": "indices" (or "indexes")).

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35465

Title: Pretransplantation Fetal-Maternal Microchimerism in Pediatric Liver Transplantation from Mother

Reviewer's code: 00054794

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-07-20

Date reviewed: 2017-08-13

Review time: 24 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review the manuscript entitled, "Pretransplantation Fetal-Maternal Microchimerism in Pediatric Liver Transplantation from Mother". Nam-Joon Yi et al. showed the importance of pretransplantation NIMA-MC or HLA-DR identity with the mother for BPCR-free survival in pediatric recipients from maternal donors. I think that it is a very interesting manuscript about the association between pretransplantation fetal-maternal microchimerism and BPCR in pediatric liver transplantation from mother. Therefore, the manuscript could benefit from revision if the manuscript is revised. Firstly, this manuscript does not have novelty. Sanada Y et al. showed that maternal grafts protect daughter recipients from acute cellular rejection after pediatric living donor liver transplantation for biliary atresia (Transplant Int 2014). You should add this paper in Reference, and discuss the content. Secondly, you should



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https:// www.wjgnet.com

show the data of post-transplant NIMA-MC, and the analysis of between post-transplant NIMA-MC and BPCR.