

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35682

Title: Acetabular cup version modelling and its clinical applying on plain radiograms

Reviewer's code: 02705200

Reviewer's country: Bulgaria

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-08-30

Date reviewed: 2017-09-03

Review time: 4 Days

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I would like to congratulate the authors for the excellent work.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35682

Title: Acetabular cup version modelling and its clinical applying on plain radiograms

Reviewer's code: 03518978

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-08-25

Date reviewed: 2017-09-07

Review time: 13 Days

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper estimated sensitivity, specificity of computer modeling of acetabular component orientation- signs of cup version on standard antero-posterior radiographs and a correlation to patients with dislocations. It also evaluated the incidence of inadequate anteversion sign among patients with dislocations. It has been found that inadequate anteversion sign appears when the anteversion angle is less than half the angle between X-ray beams in the AP hip and pelvis views. The sensitivity of the inadequate anteversion sign was 29% (95% CI 9-46%) and specificity was 92% (95% CI: 88 - 96%). Generally this is an interesting study. However there is a concern that needs to be clarified. There are many factors that determine whether or not dislocations occur after THA, such as position of the cup and femur head, the length of the stem, the muscle function, etc. This study only evaluated the correlation between cup position and hip dislocations, and therefore may ignore some confounding bias. Please address this



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https:// www.wjgnet.com

concern.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35682

Title: Acetabular cup version modelling and its clinical applying on plain radiograms

Reviewer's code: 02705018

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-09-07

Date reviewed: 2017-09-09

Review time: 2 Days

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although this is an interesting study analyzing the correlation between acetabular cup orientation and hip dislocation following THA, there are some issues to be solved in order to be appropriate this manuscript for publication. 1. Conclusion which is considered as essential part of a manuscript is not included in this paper. 2. References are not following journal's instructions and form. 3. This manuscript deals with acetabular cup position and its relation with hip stability after THA. Still there are some other parameters such as such as the length of the stem and the muscle function which potentially influence hip stability. These predisposing to hip dislocation should be taken into serious consideration in order to avoid unsafe conclusions and bias the final results.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35682

Title: Acetabular cup version modelling and its clinical applying on plain radiograms

Reviewer's code: 00467030

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-09-07

Date reviewed: 2017-09-14

Review time: 7 Days

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | [Y] No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting retrospective study on computer evaluation of acetabular component orientation whether the signs of cup version on AP radiographs correlated with patients' dislocations. The contents would be meaningful to related clinical practitioners. The following points are suggested for further consideration. 1. The demographic of the patients of the two groups are suggested to be more detailed including the gender and age (mean, range), unilateral and bilateral involved, etc. 2. The abbreviations of Table 1 such as Ds, SAI and SA would need to be defined as footnotes of the table

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35682

Title: Acetabular cup version modelling and its clinical applying on plain radiograms

Reviewer's code: 02444802

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-09-07

Date reviewed: 2017-09-15

Review time: 8 Days

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is of interest to WJO readers as it offers new insight as to a simple radiographic assessment on the x ray images gained on patients with hip prostheses and prediction on success outcome. The data analysed was rigorous and consisted of over 200 hip analyses using previously published elliptical measurement methodology. Appropriate statistics have been applied. A few grammatical changes are needed but otherwise ready for publication.