



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35728

Title: Presence of columnar-lined esophagus is negatively associated with the presence of esophageal varices in Japanese alcoholic men

Reviewer's code: 03262644

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Li-Juan Wei

Date sent for review: 2017-08-19

Date reviewed: 2017-08-19

Review time: 10 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is interesting study conducted over significant number of patients and based on the empirical observation from the authors' clinical practice that patients with CLE less frequently have EV. They tested this hypothesis among Japanese alcoholic patients by using retrospective cross-sectional design. As correctly acknowledged by the authors retrospective nature and cross-sectional design are not the best way to explore causal relationship between the two categories (i.e presence and size of EV and CLE). Nevertheless, these results are based on significant number of patients, and appropriate statistical methods have been used and therefore the results and conclusions of the study are meaningful, at least concerning the clearly established inverse correlation between the presence of CLE and EV. The observation from this study is interesting, innovative and represents the basis for the further studies which should be conducted



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

prospectively in the longitudinal fashion to furtherly test this intriguing issue.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35728

Title: Presence of columnar-lined esophagus is negatively associated with the presence of esophageal varices in Japanese alcoholic men

Reviewer's code: 03033812

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Li-Juan Wei

Date sent for review: 2017-08-19

Date reviewed: 2017-08-19

Review time: 16 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript from Japan is very interesting well-written but without a pathologic confirmation of the Barrett's esophagus the results are not valid.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35728

Title: Presence of columnar-lined esophagus is negatively associated with the presence of esophageal varices in Japanese alcoholic men

Reviewer’s code: 00051373

Reviewer’s country: Taiwan

Science editor: Li-Juan Wei

Date sent for review: 2017-08-19

Date reviewed: 2017-08-20

Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A negative observational study to describe the presence of columnar-lined esophagus is negatively associated with the presence of esophageal varices in Japanese alcoholic men and manuscript written well.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35728

Title: Presence of columnar-lined esophagus is negatively associated with the presence of esophageal varices in Japanese alcoholic men

Reviewer's code: 02904354

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Li-Juan Wei

Date sent for review: 2017-08-19

Date reviewed: 2017-08-22

Review time: 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper explored the association columnar-lined esophagus with esophageal varices (EVs) in alcoholic men. This topic is novel. I have some comments as follows. The authors concluded that "The development of CLE may impede the development of EVs, and examination for CLE may benefit alcoholics with advanced liver disease by identifying their risk for the development or progression of EVs". Although the authors provided some explanations regarding the development of CLEs and EVs in the Discussion section, the study can not explore the orders of columnar lined esophagus and EVs. Which occurs firstly? So your conclusions should be revised. Child-Pugh class/score is employed for the assessing the severity of liver cirrhosis. So the Child-Pugh class/score is not necessary in patients without liver cirrhosis. In Table 1, does the "EVs group" represent "Cirrhosis with EV" group? In other words, do all



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

patients with EVs have liver cirrhosis? This is important because some patients had non-cirrhotic portal hypertension. In Table 2, the authors combined the patients without EVs with and without cirrhosis into an individual group. The analysis might be inappropriate. The group with 1434 patients should be separated into two groups with and without liver cirrhosis. Furthermore, the comparison between patient with and without liver cirrhosis should be performed. Some new message might be provided. And then, a new comparison between cirrhotic patients with and without EVs should be performed. In patients with post-treatment varices, some scars secondary to ligation or sclerotherapy might be present. If so, does it influence the development of CLE? A new analysis should be added to compare the incidence of CLE between EVs patients with and without endoscopic treatment. The authors provided 2 figures. One is about the PHG, another is about CLE. However, the study focused on the EVs. So the figures regarding severity of EVs should be added. The figure legends should be a noun or phrase, but not a sentence. The present legends are not appropriate. Indeed, I do not understand the aim of the figure 2 by reading its legends. Please revise them. The endoscopists are skilled as diagnosing CLE and measuring the length of CLE. However, this paper is also learnt by the hepatologists. So the authors should add more information regarding how to diagnose with CLE and to measure the length of CLE. Similarly, the diagnosis and measurement of hiatal hernia should be also added in the figure.