

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36026

Title: Sequential tumor-directed and lobar radioembolization before major hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03656588

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-09-25

Date reviewed: 2017-09-25

Review time: 4 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The case provided a better clinical experience to treat the liver tumor in cirrhotic livers that couldn't resect the tumor because of insufficient liver function. Especially in variant hepatic artery to the tumor and to the future resected liver. 2) I suggest that the manuscript can be published in the form of case report in World J Gastroenterology.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36026

Title: Sequential tumor-directed and lobar radioembolization before major hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00053888

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-09-25

Date reviewed: 2017-09-25

Review time: 5 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have reported an interesting case of arterial anatomy in conjunction with tumour position that has allowed a combination of SIRT and LHA embolization to allow compensatory hypertrophy of residual liver. This combination is unlikely to be a frequent finding but it does demonstrate that thinking laterally with the multiple types & combinations of treatment that are now available is important in the management of patients with HCC on the background of cirrhosis. The case report has some academic interest but in it's current format is far too long and is attempting to be an academic paper. The surgical planning, surgery & SIRT are all well established the importance is the finding of the arterial anatomy in combination with the pathology & tumour site. The authors need to radically reduce all areas of the manuscript, including the figures.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36026

Title: Sequential tumor-directed and lobar radioembolization before major hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00722239

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-09-25

Date reviewed: 2017-09-26

Review time: 22 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report of the HCC arising in cirrhotic liver of Seg.4 which was successfully treated by sequential intra-tumor and left lobar SIRT before a left hepatectomy. The benefits of this two-step SIRT were irradiation of the tumor and inducing compensatory hypertrophy of residual liver. The manuscript is well written but the Figures needs some revision, delete useless area and assemble the pictures. I am very interested in how was the pathology of the HCC and background liver after SIRT. Please document it in detail with some histopathological photos.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36026

Title: Sequential tumor-directed and lobar radioembolization before major hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02855928

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-09-25

Date reviewed: 2017-10-06

Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Please show detailed findings of 3D image studies. It is better for journal readers. 2. Did you think the possibility of pure laparoscopic surgery after size regulation? 3. This case is Child-Pugh A, and liver remnant was sufficient.