

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36051

Title: Reverse time-dependent effect of alphafetoprotein and disease control on survival of patients with BCLC stage C hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00070056

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-08-30

Date reviewed: 2017-09-03

Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript 'Reverse Time-Dependent Effect of Alphafetoprotein and Disease Control on Survival of Patients with BCLC Stage C Hepatocellular Carcinoma ' by Francesca Romana Ponziani et al. investigated the predictors of survival in HCC patients with BCLC stage C and found that AFP and DC have a reverse and dynamic influence on survival period in a time dependent manner. The authors illustrated this conclusion via statistical analyzing effects of multiple variables on Primary Endpoint: Patients' Survival and Secondary Endpoint: Disease Control. Overall this manuscript is clearly presented, However, this study is merely a retrospective study, in addition, due to the limited sample size, complexity of other factors and strong heterogeneity, the conclusions drawn by the author may exist some bias. Furthermore, with the update of diagnosis and treatment technology, the clinical significance derived from previous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

samples maybe play a minor role. Some writing and formatting mistakes should be amended, for example, “insitutional” should be “institutional”, “anonimous” should be “anonymous”, whether “Hepatocatt” should be “Hepatocyte”.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36051

Title: Reverse time-dependent effect of alphafetoprotein and disease control on survival of patients with BCLC stage C hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00053950

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-08-30

Date reviewed: 2017-09-15

Review time: 16 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The aim of the study was to find prognostic indices in BCLC stage C of HCC. The authors note that HCC patients categorized to BCLC class C are in fact a heterogeneous group of patients and some of them could be permanently cured. It is shown that BCLC stage B patients may benefit of surgery with acceptable long term results (Kamiyama WJS Oncol 2017) but patients belonging to stage C requires sub-classification according to prognosis such as Jeong-Ju Yoo et al state in their paper in Cancer Res Treatment 2017 <https://doi.org/10.4143/crt.2017.126> The present paper does not disclose significantly new aspects compared to the Korean publication with 612 stage C patients. In the present study dynamic changes of AFP and disease control were regarded as findings not reported before. However, it is not surprising that high AFP level at the early stage and disease control long-term were significantly associated with

mortality. Some minor remarks: - Discussion should be started with major findings of the study - Exact numeric values with confidence levels are not needed in Discussion. - The finding that high AFP level is associated with poor outcome is a well known fact. - Table 4. Was the tumor of patient PT3 verified with histology? The size of the tumor could not be measured? Long-term survival with sorafenib only seems a bit suspicious. All the other long-term survivors were treated with intention of curative treatment.