

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 35658

Title: Autoimmune Hepatitis in the Setting of HIV-Infection: A Case Series

Reviewer's code: 02444878

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-07-30

Date reviewed: 2017-08-07

Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is very informative and adds new knowledge about autoimmune mechanisms of liver injury in HIV infection.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 35658

Title: Autoimmune Hepatitis in the Setting of HIV-Infection: A Case Series

Reviewer's code: 02450507

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-07-30

Date reviewed: 2017-08-18

Review time: 18 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes an interesting and rare association between autoimmune hepatitis and HIV infection in 2 adult patients. The report is concisely and clearly described and it's of potential interest for readers because information on this topic is still scanty. Minor point 1. Abbreviations should be introduced when first used and then consistently used throughout (i.e. HBV, HCV). 2. Was quantitative PCR assay used for HCV RNA detection in patient 1 resulted reactive for anti-HCV antibodies? This is important for understanding a possible role of HCV infection in the observed hepatitis. 3. Reference list should be checked for Journal style.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 35658

Title: Autoimmune Hepatitis in the Setting of HIV-Infection: A Case Series

Reviewer's code: 00071640

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-08-17

Date reviewed: 2017-08-21

Review time: 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors can not confirm the diagnosis of AIH in case 1. Because score of case 1 is lower than 15. This patient has also anti HCV positivity. Authors did not mention about HCV RNA status for this patient.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 35658

Title: Autoimmune Hepatitis in the Setting of HIV-Infection: A Case Series

Reviewer's code: 00506601

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-08-17

Date reviewed: 2017-08-21

Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This a case study of two patients who developed autoimmune hepatitis. Case 1 comments: The author states that the case presented with anti-HCV but they did not go on to confirm if this was an active HCV infection by looking for HCV-RNA so they never ruled out HCV as a cause of this man's hepatitis. In the last paragraph, there is a little too much drama to start the paragraph by saying "Due to tragic life circumstances,..". Losing someone to follow-up is not a tragic life circumstance, on the grand scale of things and not appropriate wording in a scientific paper. Case 2 is more straightforward and seem like a more probable case of autoimmune hepatitis. Conclusion I think that the advice the author is making that AIH should be considered when other etiologies are ruled out in HIV positive patients is reasonable.