

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36443

**Title:** Wernicke encephalopathy in a patient after liver transplantation: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00503228

**Reviewer's country:** Iran

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-23

**Date reviewed:** 2017-10-24

**Review time:** 10 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

- Interesting case report, but needs revisions: - Intro "Foreign reported that the prevalence rate of WE was 0.4-2.8%." What does it mean? If Foreign is an author name, you may give reference - Because your patients was in hepatic encephalopathy before transplantation, and should have undergone an emergent liver transplantation, developing a new encephalopathy 2 weeks after transplantation should be very precisely investigated before you diagnose it with Wernicke syndrome, especially your case was not alcoholoc or other classic risk factors to WE (liver disease is not usually considered a risk factor for WE), he had not all the classic triad, and also you have not gotten a thiamine level. How was the previous encephalopathy and its difference to the new one. Give the GCS score and their changes. - have you gotten any MRI for the first hepatic encephalopathy? If so, how was the difference to the new one? - Give neurological data in as much details as possible. Did the patient have autonomic dysfunction? hypotention



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

and/or hypothermia. - Had he recent memory loss? - Any peripheral neurological disorder? - Had he any respiratory dysfunction? - Have you detected pupillary changes? - WE is usually considered a cardiac disorder? How was your cardiac work up? - How was your infection work up against potential sepsis, UTI, pneumonia, peritoneal fluid, meningitis and so on - Have you employed an empirical antibiotic therapy? - Give details on the neutritional status of the patient, before and after the transplant. How was the regimen formula, if he gave parenteral therapy; if so, what had he gotten? How was the nutrition before start of the symptoms and signs?

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36443

**Title:** Wernicke encephalopathy in a patient after liver transplantation: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00503243

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-23

**Date reviewed:** 2017-10-28

**Review time:** 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report on a not frequent complication of liver transplantation is well described and useful for physicians dealing with liver transplantation.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36443

**Title:** Wernicke encephalopathy in a patient after liver transplantation: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00504828

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-23

**Date reviewed:** 2017-10-31

**Review time:** 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report reported the effectiveness of vitamin B1 on Wernicke encephalopathy after liver transplantation. As authors state, there are only a couple of reports describing Wernicke encephalopathy related to liver transplantation. Thus, I do agree with authors that it is worth to report this clinical case. Major comments 1. There are studies showing potential connection of stem cell (hematopoietic) or bone marrow transplantation and Wernicke encephalopathy. As both are transplantation-related, I think it is important to cite a few representative studies to discuss. That will increase the value of this report. For example; Z. Sadighi et al. (2015) J. Child Neurol., 30, 1307-1314; J.H. Baek et al. (2005) Bone Marrow Transplant., 35, 829-830; L.F. Bleggi-Torres et al. (2000) Bone Marrow Transplant., 25, 301-307; L.F. Bleggi-Torres et al. (1997) Bone Marrow Transplant., 20, 391-395; I. Majolino et al. (1990) Haematologica, 75, 282-284). 2. I think it is better to have at least one good reference summarizing biological effects of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

Vitamin B1 in general. Minor comments 1. I personally do not know if it is beneficial to present the data shown in Figures 1&2 as separate figures. Both show “before” and “after” treatment so that it would be more reader-friendly to have both panels in one single figure to compare side-by-side. 2. Further polishing of writing needed – we do not want unnecessary non-scientific, speaking English (for example, page 5 beginning “Vitamin B1 is a kind of water-soluble vitamins...”. 3. Please check again that the manuscript follows the formatting instruction provided by the journal. 4. I think there are several symbols that may not correctly appear on the text; for example, page 3 toward the bottom,  $8.83 \times 10^9/L$  -> I guess this is  $8.83 \times 10^9/L$ .