

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 00182114

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-03

Review time: 8 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Radiation is good effective for PVT with HCC. Radiation-induced liver disease (RILD), which typically presents as anicteric hepatomegaly and ascites 2-3 mo after RT. The pathology of radiation-induced liver damage shows changes similar to veno-occlusive disease, including endothelial swelling, terminal venule occlusion and sinusoidal congestion. RILD is a major concern in liver RT, because there is no established treatment and some patients will die of liver failure, although a few patients may recover. Therefore, please comment RILD for preoperative radiation on the PVTT. 2. Another important obstacle to RT application in HCC is the radiation susceptibility of the bowel, including the stomach and duodenum. The positive correlation between the incidence of symptomatic bowel toxicity and RT dose/bowel volume has been confirmed in several studies. Please comment bowel toxicity of stomach and intestine

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 00053888

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-03

Review time: 18 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have presented an interesting review of papers reporting liver resection in the presence of PV invasion. This is interesting but the data have not undergone meta-analysis, presumably because of the mixed bag of additional therapies given to the patients. What is demonstrated is that in these patients the surgery has been carried out safely. The authors have not mentioned the prevalence of HBV infection among these patients. There is no doubt that this will have made a significant difference to surgical outcome. Tumours in patients with HBV infection occur at an early stage in the progression of parenchymal liver disease than in other aetiological causes of cirrhosis. This means that surgery can be carried out in a greater proportion of patients and more safely. The authors do need to stress this in their conclusions. The manuscript is interesting and worthy of publication but there are a number of typographical & grammatical errors that need correction. In addition I think the authors should consider



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

bringing the manuscript together with a discussion rather than discussing each section.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 00058381

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-06

Review time: 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article on an important topic; however, the sources/references that were used must be thoroughly reviewed; e.g., page 18: "Moreover, Kokudo T. reported from the data of nationwide surveys of patients with primary liver cancer performed by the Liver Cancer Study Group of Japan that the survival benefit of liver resection was statistically significant only in patients with PVTT invading the main trunk or contralateral branch (44)": Kokudo et al. reported exactly the opposite in the paper cited here. Please check the correct writing of the names (page 24/table 2): "Capssottis (2004)" -> Capussotti) and clarify statements like "On the other hand, there have been reports of long-term survival after hepatectomy in patients with macroscopic portal invasion, but this treatment is optimal for patients with major PVTT remains controversial" (page 6/7; this sentence is grammatically unclear (although the authors provided a certificate of a language editing service), and for the reports mentioned here references would be

required). A limitation of this review is that it mainly pertains to the findings in Eastern Asian countries (as stated by the authors at the end of the manuscript).

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 01799104

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-10

Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed the literature review and try to make important conclusion that pre- or post-surgical treatment efforts can improve the patient's outcome. Indeed, the review is not so easy because the cases are so rare and the treatment methods are so variable. I only have one minor concern that the abbreviations are using so many that in the table it is not easy to find the corresponded term in the text. The abbreviations are better also mentioned at the bottom of the table.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 02438768

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-11

Review time: 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for ESPS Manuscript NO 36482

1. General comments The review paper tackles an interesting topic. However, I have some comments regarding the paper.

2. Specific comments

(1)Major comments: ①A review paper should not be simply a summary of what others have published, but should take a critical analysis of others' findings. Obviously, it is improper to end abruptly with a short conclusion in the end of each section, but perhaps more importantly, and it should be a synthesis of the relevant findings and your comments. ②While the overall structure seems to be logical, the manuscript is full of grammatical errors, making it extremely difficult to read. It is obvious that the manuscript must undergo extensive language editing.

(2)Minor comments: The format of this manuscript should be revised according to WJH's requirement.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 02441161

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-13

Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A good review about the role that hepatectomy.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36482

Title: Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 01557574

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-10-02

Date reviewed: 2017-10-13

Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author, This article title with 'Hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein tumor thrombus.' it should be published at WJGO. It has good informations and it makes a new contribution for understanding of therapy of portal vein thrombosis. Sincerely yours.