

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36904

**Title:** PET/CT Finding: Low Glucose Metabolism in the Hepatocellular Carcinoma with GPC3 Expression

**Reviewer's code:** 01557574

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-31

**Date reviewed:** 2017-10-31

**Review time:** 5 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article title with 'RETROSPECTIVE STUDY. PET/CT Finding: Low Glucose Metabolism in the Hepatocellular Carcinoma with GPC3 Expression' it should be published at WJG. It has new informations and it makes a new contribution for understanding of hepatocellular carcinoma . Sincerely yours.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36904

**Title:** PET/CT Finding: Low Glucose Metabolism in the Hepatocellular Carcinoma with GPC3 Expression

**Reviewer's code:** 03538415

**Reviewer's country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-31

**Date reviewed:** 2017-11-14

**Review time:** 14 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

what is not clear here is that the authors use correlative analyses to demonstrate that low glucose metabolism is associated with GPC3 expression. But the conclusions they made do not make sense to me. Cancers including HCC have high consumption of glucose. and therefore this should be positively correlated with GPC3 expression. In the text, the authors concluded and I report here: "Our research work confirmed that low glucose metabolism occurred in HCC tumors with GPC3 positivity on the patient study, suggesting that GPC3 may play a role in regulating the glucose metabolism in HCC ". Is it a positive correlation or a negative one with glucose metabolism. The authors should pick a side, as this is not evident reading the entire manuscript.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36904

**Title:** PET/CT Finding: Low Glucose Metabolism in the Hepatocellular Carcinoma with GPC3 Expression

**Reviewer's code:** 03548357

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-31

**Date reviewed:** 2017-11-17

**Review time:** 17 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is well written and figures are well prepared. Despite the retrospective nature, methodology of image interpretation and statistical analyses are solid. The paper fits well into the pages of World J Gastroenterology, and can be published following minor revision according to the below comments: M&M, Image Interpretation Please move the following sentence to discussion section: "T/NT ratio was reported to be more accurate to define 18F-FDG uptake in HCC because it was not influenced by serum glucose level, the uptake period and measurement variation, which often make the measurement of SUVmax inaccurate [25]." M&M, Statistical analysis: please correct "t testing" and state type of t-test (paired/unpaired) Discussion: Please compare SUVmax and T/NT ratios of primary tumors with the literature. This may help to document that you have limited selection bias in your retrospective cohort.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 36904

**Title:** PET/CT Finding: Low Glucose Metabolism in the Hepatocellular Carcinoma with GPC3 Expression

**Reviewer's code:** 00070577

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2017-10-31

**Date reviewed:** 2017-11-19

**Review time:** 19 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Li et al reported that HCC with GPC3 expression may play a role in regulating the glucose metabolism in HCC. Its concept is very intriguing, however I felt that the information is insufficient to believe the conclusions. 1) The mechanism between GPC and glucose metabolism is unclear. To show this in vitro analysis using GPC+ and - cell lines may be necessary 2) The authors should show the results of the immunostaining of GLUT 1 and 2 etc. 3) The showed the positivity of GPC3 as scores from 0-9. The authors do not analyze depending on the score.