



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36923

Title: METABOLOMICS: FROM LIVER CHIROMANCY TO PERSONALIZED PRECISION MEDICINE IN ADVANCED CHRONIC LIVER DISEASE

Reviewer’s code: 01808862

Reviewer’s country: Italy

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-11-01

Review time: 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good paper, offering some interesting point of discussion. I believe that the paper might be accepted in its present form



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36923

Title: METABOLOMICS: FROM LIVER CHIROMANCY TO PERSONALIZED PRECISION MEDICINE IN ADVANCED CHRONIC LIVER DISEASE

Reviewer's code: 03388095

Reviewer's country: Reviewer_Country

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-11-09

Review time: 11 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive, very up to date review on several very challenging topics in advanced chronic liver diseases. The review is well written, although scattered misspelling or other errors can be found.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 36923

Title: METABOLOMICS: FROM LIVER CHIROMANCY TO PERSONALIZED PRECISION MEDICINE IN ADVANCED CHRONIC LIVER DISEASE

Reviewer's code: 02861379

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-11-17

Review time: 19 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for Manuscript ID 36923: In a general, this study is tolerable, the study is interesting to some extent. This study is to summarize and analyze the existing evidences of metabolomics use in advanced chronic liver diseases, decompensated liver cirrhosis, severe alcoholic hepatitis and HCC. However, several issues are needed to be clarified(see below). 1. This manuscript is a Preliminary revision of manuscripts and there are a lot of modifications in the manuscript. So suggest that the manuscript will be submitted in the final version If it will be submitted again next time. 2. This manuscript listed a lot existing biomarker of metabolomics use in advanced chronic liver diseases. However, the biomarker analysis of each liver disease is not comprehensive and thorough. For example, for the Metabolomics and hepatocellular carcinoma, Lack of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

up-to-date research about early markers for diagnosis and prognosis of hepatocellular carcinoma(Xu RH, Wei W, Krawczyk M etal. Circulating tumour DNA methylation markers for diagnosis and prognosis of hepatocellular carcinoma. Nat Mater. 2017 Nov;16(11):1155-1161.) 3. As for prognosis of acute-on-chronic liver failure, as everyone knows, acute-on-chronic liver failure is a dynamic syndrome observed in cirrhotic patients either with or without an identified precipitating factor characterized by hepatic and or extrahepatic organ failures and high mortality. So the prognosis of acute-on-chronic liver failure should depend on multiple Metabolomics biomarkers and the diagnostic and prognostic criteria, such as CANONIC study and MELD Score and so on. The papers did not analyze these prognostic scoring systems in detail and Comparison. 4. Finally, this study has not concluded future research priorities and Prospects in detail.