

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37468

Title: Esophageal metastasis of stem-cell subtype hepatocholangiocarcinoma: atypical presentation of a rare tumor

Reviewer's code: 01557574

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-12-12

Date reviewed: 2017-12-15

Review time: 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article title with 'Esophageal metastasis of stem-cell subtype hepatocholangiocarcinoma: atypical presentation of a rare tumor' it should be published at WJG. It has new informations and it makes a new contribution for understanding of hepatocellular carcinoma .

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37468

Title: Esophageal metastasis of stem-cell subtype hepatocholangiocarcinoma: atypical presentation of a rare tumor

Reviewer's code: 00058340

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-12-12

Date reviewed: 2017-12-17

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this case report the authors described esophageal metastasis of hepatocholangiocarcinoma stem-cell subtype and elaborated on diagnostic features and therapy. The paper is well conceived and has a didactic value. Comments: 1) The authors should elaborate more why this tumor was classified as stem-cell subtype and whether this subtype has different prognosis and therapeutic outcome. What type of stem cell this tumor originates? 2) The authors state: "biopsies should be advocated in case of biological or imaging features suggesting an hepatocholangiocarcinoma". Why? Is there a different treatment? 3) Figures 2 and 3 should be clearly marked e.g. with arrows or asterisks – this would enhance their didactic value. 4) The paper requires a careful linguistic and stylistic revisions. e.g. "one wasting week of rest before new cycle" delete wasting "showed a 10-cm polypoid tumor, located in the lower third of the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

esophagus, about 30 cm from the upper dental arch. “ should be 10 cm long from incisors 5) The authors may consider adding references listed below Serra V, et al. Incidental Intra-Hepatic Cholangiocarcinoma and Hepatocholangiocarcinoma in Liver Transplantation: A Single-Center Experience. Transplant Proc. 2016 Mar;48(2):366-9. doi: 10.1016/j.transproceed.2015.12.044. PMID: 27109957 Potretzke TA et al. Imaging Features of Biphenotypic Primary Liver Carcinoma (Hepatocholangiocarcinoma) and the Potential to Mimic Hepatocellular Carcinoma: LI-RADS Analysis of CT and MRI Features in 61 Cases. AJR Am J Roentgenol. 2016 Jul;207(1):25-31. doi: 10.2214/AJR.15.14997. Epub 2016 Feb 11. PMID: 26866746

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37468

Title: Esophageal metastasis of stem-cell subtype hepatocholangiocarcinoma: atypical presentation of a rare tumor

Reviewer's code: 01799104

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-12-12

Date reviewed: 2017-12-23

Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a rare case of hepatocholangiocarcinoma with esophageal metastasis. Indeed, the diagnosis of this primary liver tumor is difficult even combination of imaging, biomarker and histology, not mention with esophageal metastasis. One minor concern is that the description of WHO 2010 classification is not easy to understand in accordance to histology of present case, especially for whom is not a pathologist.