

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 39243

Title: Trends of characteristics and outcomes of donors and recipients of deceased donor liver transplantation in the United States: 1990 to 2013

Reviewer's code: 02584466

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2018-05-03

Date reviewed: 2018-05-07

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The report is well written and will be of use to liver transplant programs. However, I noticed one significant item that will need several corrections: In the Materials and Methods section, next to last paragraph, the sentence "Diabetes insipidus (DI) was



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

classified as Type 1, and other or unknown types of diabetes, or type 2 diabetes mellitus were categorized as type 2, Diabetes mellitus (DM)" is in error. Diabetes insipidus is an entity with etiology, pathophysiology and management entirely distinct from diabetes mellitus and should not be listed as type 1 diabetes mellitus. This sentence should be corrected and, unfortunately, all the statistics with diabetes insipidus cases included as part of type 1 diabetes should be repeated with exclusion of these cases.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 39243

Title: Trends of characteristics and outcomes of donors and recipients of deceased donor liver transplantation in the United States: 1990 to 2013

Reviewer's code: 02904354

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-06-22

Date reviewed: 2018-06-28

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study. Generally, the data is well prepared. I recommend its potential publication in this journal. However, several minor comments should be addressed.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

First, the authors said "The study did not require approval by the ethics review board of our institution because it was conducted and reported per STROBE statement recommendations". I did not agree with these words. Please provide other reasons for withdrawing the ethical approval.

Second, grammar and spelling should be improved.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 39243

Title: Trends of characteristics and outcomes of donors and recipients of deceased donor liver transplantation in the United States: 1990 to 2013

Reviewer's code: 02521807

Reviewer's country: Argentina

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-06-22

Date reviewed: 2018-06-26

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have read and into my possibilities and limitations according to my expertise as virologist, I consider really interesting and original the article submitted by Ayloo et al.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

The analysis involves an acceptable number of cases of liver transplantation made during two decades in US.

I have only two suggestions to be considered by the authors:

1. There are no mention at all regarding the experience of surgeons and medical teams who made the surgery. This topic should be discussed in a context where other variables could also be influent (new in-hospital measures against post-surgery infections?) Does it an important issue for the survival improvement during the period of time? During two decades several professional and medical care changes will be determinant for the improvement. These factors are not patient-related but they could influence the outcome.
2. When the Discussion section is initiated, the authors mentioned that “It is important to understand the impact of changes that have occurred in the US over this period of time on LT outcomes”. For me, it was really difficult to find what kind of changes are referring the authors. To be more clear, it should be desirable to define more sharply what kind of changes they consider.

With profound respect, receive my best regards.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No