



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39382

Title: Immunometabolism: a novel perspective of liver cancer microenvironment and its influence on tumor progression

Reviewer's code: 00077138

Reviewer's country: Singapore

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-16

Date reviewed: 2018-04-17

Review time: 15 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Fairly well written review article of a complex topic of tumour microenvironment in liver cancer. Apart from minor grammatical/typographical errors, the overall manuscript reads well and the 2 illustrations make it easier for non-scientist to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

understand the topic. The review is well balanced and the conclusions are appropriately optimistic and yet cautionary about the possible role of immunomodulation as a therapeutic option

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39382

Title: Immunometabolism: a novel perspective of liver cancer microenvironment and its influence on tumor progression

Reviewer's code: 02530754

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-16

Date reviewed: 2018-04-19

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review by Zang Q. and cols summarizes the existing evidence regarding the influence of tumor microenvironment on liver cancer onset, progression and spreading. This is a timely and complex topic which requires further understanding to be



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

implemented into routine clinical practice in order to achieve a true personalized medicine in patients with liver cancer. The manuscript is informative and well written. The literature review is deep with 143 references included. Figures are of high quality, pertinent and aid the reading. However, as a short review, I found the paper too detailed for the average reader and I would encourage the authors to make efforts in order to summarize and to avoid repetition of some pathophysiology concepts. In addition, the authors may consider to emphasize on what are the most attractive molecules to be further investigated as therapeutic drug targets, as well as if any of them are already under investigation in randomized trials. A dedicated table would be welcomed here to delineate future directions.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39382

Title: Immunometabolism: a novel perspective of liver cancer microenvironment and its influence on tumor progression

Reviewer's code: 02943235

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-16

Date reviewed: 2018-04-25

Review time: 9 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article shows the recent findings of immunometabolism and its influence on liver cancer progression. This paper is interesting, but there are some problems. 1. In the introduction section, the authors described that liver cancer mainly includes



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) and intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma (ICC), and the two types of liver cancers may have different tumor microenvironments (TMEs). However, the article showed the TME and its roles in HCC progression. Therefore, the authors should describe these findings on ICC. 2. In the introduction section, on line 5, HCC is an abbreviation. 3. In the reference section, ref number 138, there was no name of journal.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No