

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39532

Title: Prognostic role of alpha-fetoprotein response after hepatocellular carcinoma resection

Reviewer's code: 02734287

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-04-27

Date reviewed: 2018-04-29

Review time: 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important study once again proving the value of AFP measurements in HCC. Its main conclusion is that the change in serum AFP levels between pre and postoperative samples is predictive for prognosis of patients with HCC following



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

hepatic resection. Classification of HCC patients into normal, response and non-response groups is simple and could prove as a useful clinical tool for prognostic stratification. Its main limitation is lack of definition of timing of postoperative AFP measurements and that topic should be further explored in future studies.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39532

Title: Prognostic role of alpha-fetoprotein response after hepatocellular carcinoma resection

Reviewer's code: 03998130

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-04-27

Date reviewed: 2018-04-29

Review time: 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is well written and would be of interest for the readers. However, some concerns should be raised: Major issues: The post-operative serum AFP level (post-AFP) was defined as the serum AFP level 1-180 d following resection, which



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

represent a large period of time that can lead to some bias. The authors should state this problem like a weakness of the study. Please provide the mean/median follow-up time (months). In Results it is said that Kaplan-Meier survival analyses showed that recurrence-free survival rates according to changes in serum AFP levels in the non-response group were significantly lower than those in the normal and response groups ($p < 0.05$; Fig 1a) and the overall survival rate of the non-response group was also significantly lower than the normal and response groups ($p < 0.05$; Fig 1b). However, when it was analyzed the effect of a 50% decrease from pre-AFP as a measure of responsiveness to treatment alone, no significant differences (Fig 2) were observed for both recurrence-free and overall survival times between the group of patients with post-AFP decrease of $\geq 50\%$ and the group of patients with post-AFP decrease of $< 50\%$. The two findings appear to me to be conflicting. Please comment on this. Minor issues: In Materials and Methods it is said that a total of 387 consecutive patients who underwent hepatic resection and had pathologically proven HCC at the Department of Surgery, Ramathibodi Hospital, Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand between January 2006 and December 2016 were enrolled in this study. However, furthermore only 334 patients appear to be included. Please put the data in accordance. Please remove AFP from the first line of Table 2 and 3

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39532

Title: Prognostic role of alpha-fetoprotein response after hepatocellular carcinoma resection

Reviewer's code: 03755443

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-04-27

Date reviewed: 2018-05-04

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting study. Well written manuscript. I suggest the following minor revisions: -
Update reference number 10 to included the newest version of the EASL Guidelines
(European Association for the Study of the Liver. (EASL Clinical Practice Guidelines:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Management of hepatocellular carcinoma. J Hepatol. 2018 Apr 5. pii: S0168-8278(18)30215-0. doi: 10.1016/j.jhep.2018.03.019). Please discuss the first paragraph according to the data on the newest EASL Guidelines. - Also in the first paragraph of the Discussion: reference number 32 is cited but it seems that the study to which the information refers to is actually the reference number 31. - Please revise the 8th sentence of the third paragraph of the Discussion (the one that starts with RIAZ ET AL...) because it is not a clear sentence.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No