

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39618

Title: The Proteasome Ubiquitin System and Oxidative Stress in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03475779

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-05

Date reviewed: 2018-05-07

Review time: 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article deals with a current topic but I have to express some concerns: 1)Being a review, it would have been useful to describe the methodology with which the reference articles were chosen. In fact, lacking this aspect, the choice of the articles taken into consideration is arbitrary and therefore of little significance. 2)The article is limited to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

considering only cold storage and does not take into account the methods of preservation of the livers to be transplanted with the system of perfusiuone machines in normo and sub-thermothermics, which represent the new line of research aimed at reducing damage from reperfusion. In fact, it would have been interesting to evaluate the effectiveness of the UPS in the various perfusion temperature conditions if, even after these methods, reperfusion damage was present 3) Even in the absence of an analysis of the efficacy of the UPS in normo or sub-normomothermics, the authors do not consider the different outcomes that different reperfusion solutions can determine and therefore evaluate if and how the UPS could be used in association with different reperfusion solutions while holding the criterion of cold storage. 4) The article concludes proposing to evaluate the proteasome inhibitors but does not propose a study protocol on the subject and is therefore an important analysis of their action but without making their use concrete.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39618

Title: The Proteasome Ubiquitin System and Oxidative Stress in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00034989

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-05

Date reviewed: 2018-05-08

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well structured paper with clear clinically applicable message. Minor corrections are required and all are pointed out at the attached .pdf. The extent of the references and the length of the text may be an issue but this is up to the editor to decide.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39618

Title: The Proteasome Ubiquitin System and Oxidative Stress in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 02566971

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-05

Date reviewed: 2018-05-09

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents current information about using antioxidants and proteasome inhibitors to improve organ preservation solutions to reduce the severity of IRI. Overall this is an interesting manuscript. However, there are several defects in this manuscript, which need to be addressed. 1. In keywords, "Autophagy" is not the focus of this



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

manuscript. 2. Page 6, line 6, Before “Autophagy ...” there should be added a period.
3. Ubiquitination is a well-known process that the authors describe too much detail.
However, it is not clear that how UPS acts as a defense system against cellular oxidative
stress. 4. Page 11, line 4, “MG32” should be corrected by “MG132”.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39618

Title: The Proteasome Ubiquitin System and Oxidative Stress in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03755443

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-05

Date reviewed: 2018-05-11

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS: - Please review available literature on MACHINE COLD PRESERVATION and relate it to potential effects on PROTEASOME UBIQUITIN SYSTEM. - Please review available literature on NORMOTHERMIC LIVER PRESERVATION and relate it to potential effects on PROTEASOME UBIQUITIN

SYSTEM. SPECIFIC COMMENTS: - Please spell the abbreviation UPS on page 2. - Insert a comma after DURING ISCHEMIA on row sixth of page 3. - Replace BUT by HOWEVER on fourth row of COLD STORAGE on page 4. - Replace HAVE by HAS on first row of page 5. - Replace MANY by SEVERAL on row 14th of the section OXIDATIVE STRESS IN IRI (page 5). - Insert a point before the word AUTOPHAGY on fifth row of page 6. - Replace MANY by SEVERAL on third row of section UBIQUITIN (page 6). - Replace ORGANS by ORGAN (last row of page 8). - Insert RAT between the words NON-STEATOTIC and LIVER. - Insert the words FROM RATS between the words FATTY LIVER and THROUGH.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39618

Title: The Proteasome Ubiquitin System and Oxidative Stress in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03475120

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-05

Date reviewed: 2018-05-14

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Cold ischemia/warm reperfusion injury is confirmed at least several hours, and early posttransplant period is important for liver regeneration. This point should be clearly mentioned. 2. Also, shear stress affects on posttransplant oxidative stress. Please mention this point. 3. Graft size is a key factor for oxidative stress after liver

transplantation. Behaviors of oxidative stress markers are different according to graft size. This point should be mentioned with related articles. Pretreatment of Small-for-Size Grafts In Vivo by γ -Aminobutyric Acid Receptor Regulation against Oxidative Stress-Induced Injury in Rat Split Orthotopic Liver Transplantation. Int J Hepatol. 2013;2013:149123. PMID: 24223309 Pretreatment of liver grafts in vivo by γ -aminobutyric acid receptor regulation reduces cold ischemia/warm reperfusion injury in rat. Ann Transplant. 2013;18:299-313. PMID: 23792534

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No