

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39634

**Title:** The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02860761

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-04

**Review time:** 13 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

THIS REVIEW HAS GOOD KNOWLEDGE ON HCC PATHOGENESIS IN REGARDS  
C-MET AND HGF , I THINK IT DESERVE PUBLICATION

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

**<https://www.wjgnet.com>**

*Google Search:*

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

*BPG Search:*

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39634

**Title:** The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02959144

**Reviewer's country:** Kazakhstan

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-05

**Review time:** 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review article on a relevant topic that needs a careful revision of the English language.

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39634

**Title:** The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02529007

**Reviewer's country:** Iran

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-11

**Review time:** 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript # 39634 entitled, "The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma" reviews the HGF/c-Met Signaling in Hepatocellular Carcinoma and available treatments against HCC based on HGF/c-Met inhibition. The review manuscript also included discussions on the novel explored treatments targeting the microRNAs, methylases, and

acetylases which are involved in cancer genes expression regulation. Comments: Collectively, the manuscript is well-written/organized and the summarizing tables and figure are conclusive. However, taking into consideration the excellent review article published recently with almost the same title and content (Hu CT, et al, The Therapeutic Targeting of HGF/c-Met Signaling in Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Alternative Approaches. Cancers (Basel). 2017), I would suggest that authors consider the following comments in a revised (review or mini review version) of their manuscript for clarification of the updates and novel discussions included in their manuscript compared to this recent preceding manuscript: - Title of the manuscript might be remained in a general form as it appears but the phrase “updates on” might be added. Alternatively, authors might consider a more specific title to indicate the message and novel emphasizing points of their review manuscript. For example: “the novel explored treatments on The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma”. - Authors might quote the above mentioned recent review article and addressing this manuscript properly, try to summarize the repeated materials in the text (which are already well-discussed in the prior recent review article) and clearly indicate the aim and novelty of the materials that have been added (updates and/or discussions on the novel explored treatments targeting the microRNAs, methylases, and acetylases which are involved in cancer genes expression regulation). - English edition of the manuscript is recommended throughout the manuscript.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

**<https://www.wjgnet.com>**

[ Y ] No

***BPG Search:***

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[ Y ] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39634

**Title:** The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02940151

**Reviewer's country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-11

**Review time:** 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have reviewed the role of HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) and its therapeutic potential in the treatment of HCC. This is a detailed review, however the following issues needs to be addressed. MAJOR CRITIQUES 1. There have been more than half a dozen reviews published in this field in the last five years.



Therefore the authors have to explicitly state how this review differ from the previous reviewers and what this review adds to the literature. 2. The authors should consider re-structuring the manuscript. At present the first half of the manuscript concentrates purely on the biochemical aspect of HGF/c-Met axis (pages 6 - 11). It would be better to include these into various aspects of liver disease and HCC (the second half of the manuscript), so that it would keep the reader engaged, as most readers would be Hepatologists.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39634

**Title:** The HGF/c-Met axis in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02441161

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-17

**Review time:** 12 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a very good review about the HGF/c-Met axis signaling pathways in hepatocellular carcinoma, and compounds already used or showing potential to be used in clinical trials.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No