

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 39733

**Title:** Mandated health insurance increases rates of elective knee surgery

**Reviewer's code:** 02444715

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-12-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-12-23

**Review time:** 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the paper : Mandated Health Insurance Increases Rates of Elective Knee Surgery is very interesting , and represent a very important point of view The paper include a very similar topic to another paper published in 2015: AMA Surg. 2014 Aug; 149(8): 829–836. doi: 10.1001/jamasurg.2014.857 PMID: 2509916 NIHMSID: NIHMS579672 PMID:



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

24988945 Understanding the effect of insurance expansion on utilization of inpatient surgery Chandy Ellimoottil, M.D.,<sup>1,3,4</sup> Sarah Miller, Ph.D.,<sup>2</sup> John Z. Ayanian, M.D., M.P.P,<sup>4</sup> and David C. Miller, M.D., M.P.H.<sup>1,3,4</sup>

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 39733

**Title:** Mandated health insurance increases rates of elective knee surgery

**Reviewer's code:** 02699758

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-12-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-12-24

**Review time:** 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated the effect of the reform of healthcare insurance on the rates of elective knee surgery in the tertiary-care single academic medical center. The rates of knee surgery increased in the post-reform compared to those in the post reform. Although the health insurance system is not familiar with me, the manuscript was well



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

discussed and sample size was large enough. I recommend the manuscript to be accepted without revision.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 39733

**Title:** Mandated health insurance increases rates of elective knee surgery

**Reviewer's code:** 02710967

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-12-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-12-25

**Review time:** 14 Hours, 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study has multiple limitations and some parts of the results need some explanation. The authors found that, workers' compensation 10.0% pre-reform and 16.7% post-reform ( $p = 0.2070$ ); and uninsured patients' 7.0% pre-reform and 8.3% post-reform ( $p = 0.6249$ ). Workers' compensation cases has nothing to do with the ACA,



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

how would you explain such an increase. Further, the study also found some increase in the uninsured patients after the reform application which contradict the authors' hypothesis for the study.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 39733

**Title:** Mandated health insurance increases rates of elective knee surgery

**Reviewer's code:** 02691156

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-12-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-12-27

**Review time:** 19 Hours, 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The title is referring directly to the problem at hand. The abstract is sufficient. Key words reflect the focus of the manuscript. Introduction is sound and clear. Material and Methods In this study, 2640 patients were enrolled from the pre-reform period and 7780 during the post reform. Eligible patients were limited to those seeking care from three



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://** [www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

orthopaedic surgeons with established practices at one academic institution throughout both study periods. When compared, the pre- and post-reform ICD-9 codes were found to be identical, suggesting that the spectrum of disease in both periods was similar. These ten diagnosis codes were then used to identify all new patients seen by three surgeons in pre-reform and post-reform periods. **Results** The population of uninsured patients dropped significantly post-reform from 8% to 3%, and the population of private insurance increased significantly from 57% to 61%. **Discussion** You discussed in details a number of factors that might have influence to the eligibility of each patient such as: age, sex, highest level of education, body mass index (BMI), dates of service, ICD-9 codes, and insurance status at time of presentation were recorded. Also, the billing database contains twenty-one different providers. **Limitations** eligible patients were limited to those seeking care from three orthopaedic surgeons with established practices at one academic institution throughout the study periods and not in patients from different orthopaedic departments **References** are cited appropriately the latest references while the submitted manuscript is supported by 11 references. The submitted manuscript contains useful information for physicians, administrators and even for patients. The current investigation is based in patients seeking care from 3 surgeons in the same department and not in different orthopaedic institutions. The main question to under investigation is the influence of insured or uninsured to the eligibility of patients for elective knee surgery. No doubt that the USA health care system is different of that of other countries and is dominated by different legal acts. Also, the uninsured patients are reluctant to seek surgical treatment since they cannot cover expenses. Scientific community's interest is to ensure that the quality of health care insurance reform has value for the benefit of patients. That should be the future direction for any health care reform for all over the world countries and not only the reduction of health care costs for the insurance companies benefit.





**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**Manuscript NO:** 39733

**Title:** Mandated health insurance increases rates of elective knee surgery

**Reviewer's code:** 02705018

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-12-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-12-30

**Review time:** 1 Hour, 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an overall well structured manuscript dealing with an interesting topic. However I am afraid is written in a somehow comprehensive and complex style and it is not very easy to be read. With a rewrite especially the discussion in a more simple form I believe that it would worth publication.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No