

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39929

Title: VSL#3 Alleviates Ulcerative Colitis Carcinogenesis in Mice

Reviewer's code: 02519674

Reviewer's country: Slovakia

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-28

Date reviewed: 2018-05-30

Review time: 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The overall scientific quality and importance of the manuscript is good, but not outstanding. I have several comments. Figure 1: probably some symbols missing. All treated groups look the same. it is not clear when exactly the treatment was applied and how. In the methods section "lavage" and "gavage" are being used interchangeably.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Which one is the right means of administration? The manuscript need extensive language editing. There are numerous inconsistencies and wrong scientific expressions (e.g. plasmid nuclear ratio) throughout the text. In the Results the authors claim that "As shown in figure 2, compared with the control mice, body weight loss was significant in mice treated with AOM/DSS..." Figure 2, however, does not show any significant difference between groups. Also, what are "other colitis symptoms"? Data on stool consistency are missing. What software was used for analysis of microbiota and for the visualization of the results (heatmap)? The authors conclude an increase or a decrease in some microbial species after treatment, but this is not obvious from the data/figure. The heatmap only shows one time point, so it is not possible to conclude any increase or decrease within the respective groups in time. It shows the difference between the groups after 12 weeks. So all the differences (I would prefer the terms higher or lower abundance) are strictly compared to the control group at 12 weeks. Similarly in Discussion: "For mucosal microbiota, we found that Bifidobacterium increased in mucosa after VSL#3 supplementation". The authors did not show any change in the group treated by VSL#3. They only showed differences between groups at 12 weeks. The title should be also changed, because the authors did not show any alleviation of carcinogenesis using VSL#3. They showed that VSL#3 could act preventively.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https:// www.wjgnet.com

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39929

Title: VSL#3 Alleviates Ulcerative Colitis Carcinogenesis in Mice

Reviewer's code: 02941672

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-28

Date reviewed: 2018-06-10

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author had revealed that the preventive effect of 5-ASA and VSL#3 for carcinogenesis by cytokine inhibition in AOM/DSS induced mice model. The VSL#3 alone had anti-tumor effect than combination of 5-ASA and VSL#3. In contrast, 5-ASA alone suppressed cytokine expression than combination of them. The reasons maybe



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

unknown, but some hypothesis or explanation need to be described in discussion.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No