

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 39955

**Title:** Stem cell therapy for faecal incontinence: Current state and future perspectives

**Reviewer's code:** 03550192

**Reviewer's country:** Ukraine

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-23

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-25

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Peer Review of Manuscript NO: 39955 Title: Stem cell therapy for faecal incontinence: current state and future perspectives

GENERAL COMMENTS: The research is important because faecal incontinence is an illness which affects adults and children. It is associated with disabling consequences, considerable embarrassment, anxiety and poor quality of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

life. The research findings are significant. Literature data analyzed in the review give the evidence that stem cell therapy is safe, stimulates the repair of both acute and subacute anal sphincter injuries and gives some encouraging functional results. The research is innovative. There are no similar “exhaustive” research in the literature. The manuscript’s presentation is of high quality and readability. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS FOR THE VARIOUS ARTICLE SECTIONS:** The main and short titles adequately reflect the major topic and content of the study. The abstract provides a clear delineation between the research background, objectives results, and conclusions. However there is no information about the methods used in the study in this section. The abstract presents the innovative and significant points related to the background, objectives, materials and methods, results, and conclusions. The materials and methods are sufficiently described for the results and conclusions of the review. The method used in the study is adequate to its aim and will allow other investigators to reproduce the study. The study design is adequate to its aim. The results’ data draw firm scientific conclusions. The discussion is well organized and conclusions appropriately reflect the reviewed literature. The discussion describes findings based upon systematic theoretical analyses of the results and provides valuable conclusions. According to the text, healthcare costs for faecal incontinence treatment amounted to 2897\$ or 2169€ per year. It would be appropriate to mention in the discussion the authors’ opinion about the potential cost of stem cell treatment of faecal incontinence. Will it cost more or less than treatment without stem cells? The references are appropriate to the topic of the review, relevant, and up-to-date. The tables fully reflect the results of the study. The tables present the maximum of information in the clear manner. **LANGUAGE EVALUATION B:** Minor language polishing is required: There are several mistakes, for example: Indirect cost are... repair is the most successfully... and health levator ani... rectal mucosa and EAS was approximated... so findings not respond... authors objective that... all of them



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

evaluated at... and many associate high morbidity rates... variable on  
literature...and the like. CLASSIFICATION OF THE MANUSCRIPT B: Very good

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- [Y] No

##### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 39955

**Title:** Stem cell therapy for faecal incontinence: Current state and future perspectives

**Reviewer's code:** 03478635

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-06-06

**Date reviewed:** 2018-06-08

**Review time:** 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is very important in terms of investigating the faecal incontinence in clinical stem cell therapy. In abstract, the muscle-derived or mesenchymal stem cells are needed to be defined more clearly.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 39955

**Title:** Stem cell therapy for faecal incontinence: Current state and future perspectives

**Reviewer's code:** 00573611

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-06-06

**Date reviewed:** 2018-06-09

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review article, the authors reviewed the published literature related to faecal incontinence and stem cell therapy and currently ongoing clinical trials. The authors tried to identify and summarize the existing published knowledge of stem cell utilization as a treatment for faecal incontinence. Comments This is an interesting



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

review article. This manuscript is well-written. The format of this manuscript may need to be modified. The reviewer has no further comments.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No