



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 39969

Title: While One in Five Hepatocellular Carcinoma Patients in the U.S. are Hispanic, Less Than 40% Were Eligible for Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00503561

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-05-23

Date reviewed: 2018-05-23

Review time: 0 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is the very basic descriptive data based on SEERs. Just add several analyses, which the readers may be interested in: 1. They stated surveillance covers 18 regions. Provide region to region difference. 2. Is it possible the profile shown in Table 1 can be compared



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

to the profile of Whites and Asian in the same period and areas.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

Response to Reviewer

We thank the reviewer for your comments and suggestions. The reviewer is correct in that our dataset does in fact cover 18 specific geographic regions in the U.S. While we appreciate the reviewer's suggestion in stratifying our analyses by region, stratification of cancer analyses by region is not recommended given the potential to introduce biases and the utility of this database was not designed to perform region-specific analyses but rather to provide a more robust national estimate of HCC epidemiology. Furthermore, the inclusion and sample of regions were not random, which would further intro bias and inaccuracy when analyses were stratified. Thus, we respectfully do not



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

recommend stratification by region. The second suggestion to include additional data in Table 1 with respect to non-Hispanic whites and Asians is a good idea. While our study is specifically focused on Hispanic populations, we think this is a reasonable request and we have updated our table 1 according to this reviewer's suggestion.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 39969

Title: While One in Five Hepatocellular Carcinoma Patients in the U.S. are Hispanic, Less Than 40% Were Eligible for Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03647931

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-06-01

Date reviewed: 2018-06-12

Review time: 11 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript addresses a very important challenge in Hispanic patients with HCC. This topic is very interesting and is of great clinical relevance. The study is properly designed and the paper is very well written. However, i have few minor comments and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

queries: 1- what is the percentage of hispanic population in those 18 regions from which the data were collected, compared to the national figure? 2- Did the authors study the effects of other factors such as alcohol consumption, obesity, and diabetes mellitus? 3- Could the authors give more detailed explanation, why the incidence of HCC among hispanics surpassed Asians since 2012? did HBV vaccination played a role in risk reduction among Asians? 4- Was there any data comparing Hispanics born in USA versus those who migrated t USA? 5- Is there any data comparing white versus non-white hisanics?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

Response to Reviewer

We thank the reviewer for these helpful questions and suggestions. For your first



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

question, unfortunately the dataset does not provide the proportion of Hispanic patients captured within each of the SEER regions included in the national cancer registry. The impact of other factors such as alcohol, obesity, and diabetes is important as they may also affect HCC risk and disease progression. Unfortunately these variables were not available in the dataset to be included in our analyses. We have added this limitation to the discussion section of our manuscript. We have additionally added comments in the introduction to hypothesize contributors to HCC incidence rising above that of Asians in 2012. This likely reflects a combination of factors including effective HBV vaccination in Asians and the emergence of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease in Hispanics. While it would be interesting to directly compare U.S. born with foreign-born or migrant Hispanics as it relates to HCC outcomes, these data were not available for inclusion in our analyses. While our study was specifically focused on evaluating outcomes in Hispanic populations, we acknowledge the reviewer's interest in seeing data on white populations. We have added these data to our revised table 1.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 39969

Title: While One in Five Hepatocellular Carcinoma Patients in the U.S. are Hispanic, Less Than 40% Were Eligible for Liver Transplantation

Reviewer’s code: 02529007

Reviewer’s country: Iran

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-06-01

Date reviewed: 2018-06-14

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript ID 39969 entitled, “While One in Five Hepatocellular Carcinoma Patients in the U.S. are Hispanic, Less Than 40% Were Eligible for Liver Transplantation” evaluated disparities in HCC tumor stage at diagnosis with a focus on Hispanics with HCC in the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

U.S. Findings indicated that despite the increase in the proportion of HCC in Hispanic populations (over 20% of HCC patients in the U.S. during 2013-2014 were of Hispanic ethnicity), less than half of them were within Milan Criteria (42.6%) at time of diagnosis. Furthermore, significant disparities among this group were observed, with disproportionately higher risk of advanced tumor stage at presentation seen among Hispanic men, older Hispanic patients, and uninsured Hispanic patients. Authors concluded that further efforts at HCC screening and surveillance are needed among this group to improve early detection. Comments: Over all the manuscript is well-written and organized. The following comments might help in further improvement of the article in a minor revised version. -Figures 1 and 2 harbor proper titles but the figure legends to make the figures self-explanatory for the deduced conclusions with introducing the abbreviations at last sentences of the figure legends are absent. Please provide the required corresponding figure legends. - There is no 2018 recent citations in the manuscript. I propose to get use of the following articles in Introduction and discussion sections: - Racial and Ethnic Differences in Presentation and Outcomes of Hepatocellular Carcinoma. Rich NE, Hester C, Odewole M, Murphy CC, Parikh ND, Marrero JA, Yopp AC, Singal AG. Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2018 May 31. pii: S1542-3565(18)30571-8. doi: 10.1016/j.cgh.2018.05.039. - Higher risk of hepatocellular carcinoma in Hispanic patients with hepatitis C cirrhosis and metabolic risk factors. Wong A, Le A, Lee MH, Lin YJ, Nguyen P, Trinh S, Dang H, Nguyen MH. Sci Rep. 2018 May 8;8(1):7164. doi: 10.1038/s41598-018-25533-2. - Surveillance for hepatocellular cancer. Roskilly A, Rowe IA. Clin Med (Lond). 2018 Apr 1;18(Suppl 2):s66-s69. doi: 10.7861/clinmedicine.18-2-s66. - When and how should we perform a biopsy for HCC in patients with liver cirrhosis in 2018? A review. Russo FP, Imondi A, Lynch EN, Farinati F. Dig Liver Dis. 2018 Mar 20. pii: S1590-8658(18)30232-9. doi: 10.1016/j.dld.2018.03.014. [Epub ahead of print] Review.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

Response to Reviewer

We thank the reviewer for these helpful comments. We have revised the figure legends to provide more detail to help with the interpretation of Figure 1 and Figure 2. We also thank the reviewer for the additional references and have included these appropriately in the introduction section.