Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 40645

Title: The Surgeon's Perspective on Short Bowel Syndrome: Where Are We?

Reviewer's code: 03727922

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Ying Dou

Date sent for review: 2018-08-07

Date reviewed: 2018-08-10

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[Y] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting manuscript – "The surgeon's perspective on short bowel syndrome: where are we?" - that needs improvement in the methods and description of the positive benefits of this study. Needs some clarification to better interpretation of its importance. Major Introduction - I believe it is

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

necessary to be more clearer and avoid discussing. Material and Methods - Important to state the information on approval of a Local Ethical Committee and also be provided the number and year. Should describe clearly the selection, type of the study and also is mandatory to better explain the study performed. Where were data collection? Search of material and data? Discussion - I suggest describing the real benefit of this study in clinical practice and also is mandatory discribe the limitations of this study.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 40645

Title: The Surgeon's Perspective on Short Bowel Syndrome: Where Are We?

Reviewer's code: 03742333

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ying Dou

Date sent for review: 2018-08-07

Date reviewed: 2018-08-14

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [Y] Advanced [ ] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have read with great interest the manuscript entitled "The surgeon's perspective on short bowel syndrome: where are we?". In this editorial the authors provide initially a brief overview about short bowel syndrome. Thereafter, they describe the role of parenteral nutrition in the treatment of this condition and the surgical options available.

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Finally, concepts of intestinal transplantation are discussed, such as indication of the procedure, immunosuppressive regimes and prognosis. The topic is relevant, and the view of the authors based on scientific evidence. Hence, this editorial may add in the current literature updating the knowledge about this subject. Despite its merit some issues need to be addressed. Major comments: 1. Punctuation needs reviewing throughout the manuscript. The use of colon (:) is repetitive and misused, it could be replaced by a full stop (.) in many points. Colon should be used to introduce an example or an explanation. One example is the first use of colon in the introduction, the phrase is excessively long, and the use of a full stop will improve the language. Similar issues occur repetitively along the manuscript. 2. The citation of "Dudrick" in the introduction may be replaced by "Wilmore et al.". This is because Wilmore is the first author of the manuscript that the authors refer to. 3. The phrase "Since Dudrick has demonstrated long-term survival with parenteral nutrition (PN) in a child affected by SBS (5), nowadays home PN represents the standard of care in patients affected by massive loss of small bowel with excellent long term results (6-12). However, PN uses the intravenous route to supplement the nutrients and fluids. Therefore, it does not replace physiologically the bowel function. " needs reviewing. 4. In the section "Study analysis", the classification presented in the first paragraph (very short bowel syndrome, ultra short bowel syndrome or no gut syndrome) needs a reference. Is this widely accepted? Who created this classification? Minor comments: 1. The abstract may benefit from rewording at some points. For example, not sure about the use of "implement absorption" or "colon has its digestive importance". Moreover, the abbreviation "SBS" is used in the abstract without being explained before.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No