

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 40718

**Title:** Stem cell transplantation for treatment of end-stage liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 03253490

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-07-06

**Date reviewed:** 2018-07-11

**Review time:** 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study is well designed. The authors are to be commended on a nicely written report. I enjoyed reading it.

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 40718

**Title:** Stem cell transplantation for treatment of end-stage liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 03024187

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-07-24

**Date reviewed:** 2018-08-03

**Review time:** 10 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors aimed to review the stem cell transplantation for the treatment of end-stage liver disease. Even if very short, the review contains details on the recent literature concerning the topic. However, before to be accepted for publication the manuscript should be improved. Specific comments: - Please declare all the authors' contribution.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

-The title reflect the main subject of the paper, however the abstract should be improved because it sound repetitive in the first part. Moreover, in the sentence "...FDA and government" maybe it is better to add the plural "governments", whether it is a general concept (e.g. not for US or China only). - Core tips: "Stem cells have the capacity for multiple rounds of differentiation and self-renewal", please change the sentence in "Stem cells have the capacity for multiple rounds of self-renewal and differentiation "; the same sentence has been wrongly used in the text of the manuscript. -All the manuscript: Please repeat the reference numbers through the text when it help the comprehension and to not leave statements alone. Although a certified revision of the English has been declared, the manuscript show different styles through the text. Please revised the English form. -The Introduction is confusing to me in the chronology of the items described. The basic concept on stem cell are very poor, and the bibliographic references are not always pertinent to the statements. Sentence "In reality, the term "stem cells...." What do you mean for "in reality"? -Main Paragraph: Rephrase the first paragraph, which is unclear. The web site "www.clinicaltrials.gov.cn" is not available. Not always clear when the trails have been approved in China or US. The content could be improved. E.g. the recent meta analysis from the authors. The authors claim research need more work to guarantee the safety, but the side effects and criticisms have been poorly described. - References. For citation from websites, the full URL should be given and the date when the reference was last accessed (e.g. [15]).

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- [ ] The same title
- [ ] Duplicate publication
- [ ] Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

[ Y ] No

***BPG Search:***

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[ Y ] No

**Re-review:** I revised the replay by the authors and I agree for the publication.