

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 40734

Title: Hip Hemi-Arthroplasty for Neck of Femur Fracture: What is the current evidence?

Reviewer's code: 02710967

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-07-10

Date reviewed: 2018-07-11

Review time: 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good review. It would be useful if the authors add a section to tell guys there own practice managing these fractures

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 40734

Title: Hip Hemi-Arthroplasty for Neck of Femur Fracture: What is the current evidence?

Reviewer's code: 02689728

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-07-10

Date reviewed: 2018-07-14

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive review of the hip hemi-arthroplasty literature to conclude: the posterior approach should be avoided, unipolar is preferable to bipolar, cemented is superior to press-fit, and staples and sutures are equally appropriate. The quality of this manuscript is high. Since hip fracture incidence continues to climb, this



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

manuscript is timely and will appeal to the majority of the readership. This manuscript address some of the major decisions that must be made regarding hip-hemi arthroplasty, however, a follow-up review could be consider to address: pain control, post-dressing, management of blood loss, hip precautions, and rehabilitation. 1 Title. Appropriate. 2 Abstract. Appropriate. 3 Key words. Appropriate. Please include commas. 4 Background. Appropriate. 5 Methods. N/A. 6 Results. N/A. 7 Discussion. The discussion is clear and concise. 8 Illustrations and tables. Provided xrays are helpful and appropriate. 9 Biostatistics. N/A. 10 Units. N/A. 11 References. Up to date and appropriate. 12 Quality of manuscript organization and presentation. Very high. 13 Research methods and reporting. Appropriate. 14 Ethics statements. N/A.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 40734

Title: Hip Hemi-Arthroplasty for Neck of Femur Fracture: What is the current evidence?

Reviewer's code: 03068027

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-07-10

Date reviewed: 2018-07-22

Review time: 12 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The argument is common but still hot since we see in our every day practice methods of treating these fractures with hemiarthroplasty but without proper evidence on various methods/techniques. The manuscript is interesting and comprehensive of a common issue for orthopaedic surgeons across the world, the hemiarthroplasty for fractures of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

the neck of femur. The posterior approaches are correlated with higher rates of complications compared to the other approaches and the cemented types of prosthesis are preferable but no real advantage of bipolar on monopolar prosthesis. Also cemented prosthesis are preferable. Every orthopaedic surgeon must read a concise article like this to avoid errors in the delivery treatment of these common but life threatening pathology

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No