

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 41490

Title: Glutaric acidemia type II patient with thalassemia minor and novel electron transfer flavoprotein-A gene mutations: Case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 00722239

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-08-17

Date reviewed: 2018-08-24

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good case report of Glutaric acidemia type II (GA II) patient with thalassemia. The case is rare and interesting, and the manuscript is well-written. I consider this paper is well-match to the journal concept. I have only two minor comments. First, in the Title,



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

the CARE checklist requires to include the words “case report” in Title. The word “thalasemia” should be “thalassemia”? Second, I have interested in thalassemia accompanied with GA II. Does thalassemia have some relationships with GA II? or incidentally accompanied? Please add the discussion regarding this issue based on literature searching.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 41490

Title: Glutaric acidemia type II patient with thalassemia minor and novel electron transfer flavoprotein-A gene mutations: Case report and review of the literature

Reviewer's code: 00722122

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-08-17

Date reviewed: 2018-08-30

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor Following are my comments after reviewing the manuscript with the title "Glutaric acidemia type II patient with thalassemia minor and novel ETF-A gene mutations". The title of the manuscript is "Glutaric acidemia type II patient with



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

thalassemia minor and novel ETF-A gene mutations” The manuscript does not reflect strongly on these dual comorbidities of GAI and thalassemia nor does satisfy the presence of novel mutations pathogenic in this patient or has positive influence on prognosis. Please explain or give reason why this case is important enough to be reported. Please correct the word GA II at places as GAI There are frequent spelling mistakes and require English language editing at many places. Please go through the manuscript carefully In case report section, give full form of NICU Use word “initial” instead of “first line” laboratory test The citations in introduction are not in order after citing 3rd reference, authors have cited 5th reference. Authors claim that “these mutations were assessed to be cause of the disease” please explain how? What is meant by “Patient is followed by routine controls”? What is average life expectancy of these patients? Please specify in discussion. The abbreviation “AC” for Acylcarnitines should be mentioned where this was used initially. As such no conclusion is provided in main text after or at the end of discussion Remove word “outline” from the heading of table1 and give full form of DBS in table 2.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No