



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42761

Title: Safety of Fecal Microbiota Transplantation in Chinese Single-center Children: a Retrospective Analysis

Reviewer's code: 02537353

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-15

Date reviewed: 2018-10-19

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the safety of fecal microbiota transplantation (FMT) in children, by a retrospective study, including 49 patients. The Title reflects the main subject of the manuscript, the Abstract well summarizes the described study and the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Key words reflect the focus of the manuscript About the manuscript the Background is too short and very general, in addition the author declare that " is also much clinical research focusing on FMT to treat different diseases" but the references ?? the Methods have well been described About the Results, The authors declared that the immune state was an independent risk factor for AE occurrence but which type of the immune state, immunodeficiT ? or ? Did The authors evaluated the the distribution of T cells' subsets ? and the inflammatory status ? In addition, is absent the number of the local ethical endorsement

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42761

Title: Safety of Fecal Microbiota Transplantation in Chinese Single-center Children: a Retrospective Analysis

Reviewer's code: 00742196

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-18

Date reviewed: 2018-10-23

Review time: 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this retrospective observational study, Dr. Zhang et al reported their experience with 49 children who underwent fecal microbiota transplantation (FMT) treatments. There were a total 114 FMT treatments performed on those 49 patients in a single center. They



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

evaluated the adverse events (AEs) in short-term (48 hours) and long-term (up to 3 months). They noted that the incidence of short-term AEs was 26.32% (30/114). The most common short-term AEs were abdominal pain, diarrhea, fever and vomiting. All short term AEs were all self-limited and symptom-free within 48 hours. There were 2 cases with severe AEs presented with GI bleeding. One patient with primary immunodeficiency died due to sepsis and liver failure 4 weeks after FMT. Other than this, there were apparently no relevant long-term AEs during 3 months' follow up. AEs were more common in immunodeficient patients. This is an important field which clearly needs more clinical experience and reports about FMT in children, especially the criteria of patient selection, efficacy, and safety. While authors present their data about the safety of FMT in children, they did not present the criteria for patient selection and efficacy. I think that additional data should be added into the paper. Other suggestions: 1, Table 1 should be divided into 2-3 tables. The table 1 can be patient demographics and others may be presented in other tables and presented in a different way. For example, AEs are more common in patients with immunodeficiency, therefore, AEs may be analyzed and presented in patients that divided into 2 groups: the group with immunodeficiency and those not immuno-compromised. Furthermore, AEs from different route of administration (enema vs. upper GI administration) may be interesting to know as well. 2, As mentioned above, the data in the current table 2 may be presented for 2 different groups and 2 different way of FMT administration.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42761

Title: Safety of Fecal Microbiota Transplantation in Chinese Single-center Children: a Retrospective Analysis

Reviewer's code: 00742108

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-18

Date reviewed: 2018-11-04

Review time: 17 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The manuscript is about a trend topic recently all over the world. The originality and speciality of the study comes from the following reasons; it is obtained in childhood, some of the donors are relatives, a considerable follow-up duration. 2. The manuscript is

well, concisely and coherently organized and presented. Also the number and content of the tables are sufficient. 3. The manuscript adequately describes the background, present status and significance of the study. 4. The manuscript interprets the findings adequately and appropriately, highlighting the key points concisely, clearly and logically. 5. The manuscript meets the requirements in terms of ethics, biostatistics and inform consent. 6. The title should be better if it is arranged as follows or any other type: "Safety of Fecal Microbiota Transplantation in Chinese Children: a single-center and retrospective study". According to me, this part (Chinese Single-center Children) of the title is not appropriate. 7. The authors should correct the highlighted words in terms of English grammar listed below: - "Staphylococcus aureus, Vibrio parahaemolyticus, Vibrio cholerae), ova and" in "line 136". - "Preparation the bacterial liquid" in line 142. - Description of this abbreviation "SAEs" has not been defined in the text anywhere; "FMT beyond mild or moderate AEs. AEs and SAEs were determined to be" in line 178, "not considered an SAE. The patient was diagnosed with chronic active EBV" in line 284. - "Table 1 shows the characteristics of all patients and donors" in line 191. "Table 1" should be placed at the end of the sentence.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No