

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42771

Title: Nutrient drink test: a promising new tool for irritable bowel syndrome diagnosis.

Reviewer's code: 02823396

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-14

Date reviewed: 2018-10-16

Review time: 2 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have review this interesting and well done manuscript focus on a new nutrient drink test for diagnose IBS. The authors have demonstrated strong differences between controls and patients with both low and high nutrient drinks. I agree with authors than more date are needed and probably manometric and barostatic analysis to demonstrated



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

results from validated questionnaires

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

AUTHOR'S RESPONSE

Dear reviewer, thank you for your effort and time spent in reviewing our manuscript.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42771

Title: Nutrient drink test: a promising new tool for irritable bowel syndrome diagnosis.

Reviewer's code: 03966983

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-24

Date reviewed: 2018-10-26

Review time: 2 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study by Estremera-Arevalo et al. aimed to evaluate the nutrient drink test (NDT) for the diagnosis of the Irritable Bowel Syndrome. I have some concerns regarding the methodological issues: 1- Please state the number of the patients with gastro-oesophageal reflux disease (GORD) which was included. 2- In the abstract section



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

it is better to add the “randomized clinical trial” instead of “case control study”. 3- The recruitment of healthy subjects was not explained clearly (e.g via advertisement or ...). 4- The flow chart of patients and healthy subjects’ recruitment through the study is highly recommended. 5- How did they matched the BMI?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

AUTHOR’S RESPONSE

Dear reviewer, thank you for your effort and time spent in reviewing our manuscript. The number of patients with GORD, recruitment details and recruitment flowchart are now included in the manuscript. We also added an explanation about how BMI was matched between cases and controls.

We deeply discussed your suggestion of naming our project a Randomized Controlled Trial instead of a Case-Control Study. This is a difficult decision since the terminology

defining an RCT is rather ambiguous, allowing multiple kinds of studies within its definition. Our position is to preserve the description of Case-Control study. The main reasons are that we randomized the same dietary intervention in both groups and studied its performance as a diagnostic test instead of as a treatment, and that we followed the STROBE guideline designed for Case-Control studies. We will very happily re-discuss this in case you consider it necessary.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42771

Title: Nutrient drink test: a promising new tool for irritable bowel syndrome diagnosis.

Reviewer's code: 02441672

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-24

Date reviewed: 2018-11-05

Review time: 12 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I agree with the comments of reviewer number 1(03966983)and would like to include 2 suggestions: 1- When corrections are made I suggest that the manuscript be published as a short communication. The number of patients evaluated is small. 2- The discussion should emphasize the importance of the Rome criteria for the diagnosis of IBS and the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

biopsychosocial nature of the disease. This latter factor can lead to false positive results in a small number of cases of patients studied

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

AUTHOR'S RESPONSE

Dear reviewer, thank you for your effort and time spent in reviewing our manuscript. We have included a comment on the importance of the Rome criteria for the diagnosis of IBS and the biopsychosocial nature of the disease as a possible bias. Although a large number of determinations were generated for every subject during a wide period of time, the short number of patients is another limitation of this pilot study. Both issues have been outlined in the discussion.