



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 42795

**Title:** A six-long non-coding RNA signature predicts recurrence-free survival in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02527644

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-16

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-29

**Review time:** 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting study on the prognostic impact of non-coding RNA signature on RFS in HCC patients. The molecular approach seems to be novel and interesting. However, it remains to me completely unclear how the HCC sets have been treated. Are



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

the patients receiving surgical or non-surgical treatments?. More data on patients' characteristics is essential, such as neoadjuvant locoregional treatment, waiting times, tumor grading and vascular invasion. In Addition, I would advise a multivariate analysis on prognostic factors after the study population has been clearly defined.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 42795

**Title:** A six-long non-coding RNA signature predicts recurrence-free survival in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 03724953

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-16

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-30

**Review time:** 14 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

In this article, Gu JX et al. analyzed the prognostic role of lncRNA signature in HCC. Several articles using similar concept are published in other cancer types. The statistic methods are reliable. The results provide some novel information in this field. The



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

authors also revised the method section to avoid self-plagiarism. Generally, this is a reasonable study.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- [ ] The same title
- [ ] Duplicate publication
- [ ] Plagiarism
- [ Y ] No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- [ ] The same title
- [ ] Duplicate publication
- [ ] Plagiarism
- [ Y ] No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 42795

**Title:** A six-long non-coding RNA signature predicts recurrence-free survival in hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer’s code:** 00503441

**Reviewer’s country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-16

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-09

**Review time:** 24 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript by Gu JX et al. is an interesting study about the relationship between six-long non-coding RNA signature and recurrence free survival in HCC affected patients. The Authors investigated liver tissue samples from 108 patients and they



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

constructed a six-lncRNA signature for prognosis prediction of HCC. This risk model should provide new clinical evidence for the accurate diagnosis and targeted treatment of HCC. The paper is well written, also the statistical analysis is appropriate. However, the Reviewer reports some weaknesses of this paper. MAJOR 1. Among the enrolled patients, the number of females is too low. 2. HCV infection should also be searched in the patients 3. How long is the follow-up? How did the Authors evaluate tumor recurrence in the patients? The characteristics of recurrent tumors should be detailed reported in the manuscript. 4. The Authors should specify which will be the concrete application of their model to the clinical practice and its cost. MINOR 1. A few typos, for example "algorism" repeated several times, are present in the manuscript.

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No