



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 42872

Title: Necrolytic acral erythema in a human immunodeficiency virus/hepatitis C virus
coinfected patient: A case report

Reviewer's code: 02904354

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-16

Date reviewed: 2018-10-22

Review time: 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting case. I recommend the publication in this journal. The authors clearly said that the correlation of HCV and NAE had been known. In the present case report where only a diagnosis of HIV was added in your patient with HCV, the novelty and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

originality should be further emphasized. As for the figure 1, please specify the locations of necrolytic acral erythema. The authors said the improvement of erythema. Please add the relevant figures. The cases of NAE in HCV patients should be briefly reviewed in a new Table. Spelling errors are readily seen. Please see the highlights in the attachment.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 42872

Title: Necrolytic acral erythema in a human immunodeficiency virus/hepatitis C virus
coinfected patient: A case report

Reviewer’s code: 02529007

Reviewer’s country: Iran

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-25

Date reviewed: 2018-10-26

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript # 42872 entitled, “Necrolytic Acral Erythema in a HIV/HCV Coinfected Patient : A Case Report and Literature Review” describes a case of NAE in a 66 year-old HIV/HCV coinfectd female patient with well-controlled Human Immunodeficiency



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Virus (HIV) infection on highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) and untreated chronic Hepatitis C (Genotype 1b) with cirrhosis presented with painless, non-pruritic rash for one week at her feet and legs associated with edema. Skin histopathology demonstrated bullous/hemorrhagic cellulitis with thick parakeratosis, impetiginization of the dermis and rare scattered neutrophilic infiltrates with dermal hemorrhage. Patient was started on prednisone and zinc supplementation with resolution of the lesions and improvement of rash. Authors concluded that clinical recognition of NAE and early skin biopsy to confirm the diagnosis is important specially in HCV/HIV co-infected patients. Comments: NAE has been described since 1996, first in HCV infected patients and later in other non-HCV infected patients. The only novelty of the present report might be the HCV/HIV co-infection of the reported case. Therefore, it is assumed that authors might strongly focus on this aspect. That is: - Is there any different observation for this case and just HCV-infected or even HCV non-infected patients reported to date? - What is the opinion of authors concerning the potential role of HIV coinfection in this reported case? What they can propose? Any additional/different symptoms or response to the therapy compared to the other just HCV-infected or even HCV non-infected patients reported cases to date? - How authors came to this conclusion that clinical recognition of NAE and early skin biopsy to confirm the diagnosis is important specially in HCV/HIV co-infected patients? Is it more important than just HCV-infected patients and Specifically in HCV/HIV infected patients? Therefore, authors are supposed to specifically discuss their results (observatory and clinical examinations) as well as response to the therapy compared to the prior reports one by one to reach to their conclusion. In the present shape of the manuscript the discussion section is just providing background information in a general form.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 42872

Title: Necrolytic acral erythema in a human immunodeficiency virus/hepatitis C virus
coinfected patient: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03262371

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-10-25

Date reviewed: 2018-10-26

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor Thanks for inviting me to review this manuscript entitled "Necrolytic Acral Erythema in a HIV/HCV Coinfected Patient: A Case Report and Literature Review". The case report is about Necrolytic acral erythema (NAE) which can be seen in hepatitis



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

C infected patients or subjects without this infection. The manuscript is well-written and the case has been presented well. But I think that the condition of NAE has been reported in both HCV-infected and HCV-non-infected patients in the literature. From this aspect, the case report has no novelty. However, I believe that the case report can be suitable for publication if authors could add a new part to their manuscript as "literature review" in the format a table for review of previously published cases about the aforementioned case. It can provide data regarding the possible existence of HCV infection, the method of diagnosis and treatment and etc. Best Reviewer

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No