

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43434

Title: Diagnosis of erythropoietic protoporphyria with severe liver injury: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00225294

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-12

Date reviewed: 2018-12-19

Review time: 15 Hours, 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ORIGINAL FINDING: This case report describes a case of erythropoietic protoporphyria (EPP) diagnosed in a 26-years old male. The dermatologic symptoms appeared in the young ages but did not conduct to an evaluation of other systemic markers. **QUALITY**

OF THE FINDING: Here, the authors provide a good description of a genetically

provoked EPP with the identification of the affected locus that may serve to track the potential heritage of the disease in the familial environment. The pathological description is very clear and the potential risks in the assessment of the EPP have been correctly evaluated. The publications related to EPP are not so rare. Public data bases show more than 900 studies on EPP, mainly focused in the identification of the skin alterations due to the pathology, including pain in hands and feet. Perhaps the authors can elaborate a little bit more the description of this case through the comparison of the current literature with other mutations that promote a graver EPP. This is important from a pedagogic point of view in the field of pediatric intervention. For example, the recent paper in J Pediatr. 2018 Nov;202:320-323.e2., provides a good analysis. Authors need to correct the wording of the text since in some parts, although the ideas behind the text can be inferred, the sentence is not appropriate. Also, some typo errors are present along the manuscript.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43434

Title: Diagnosis of erythropoietic protoporphyria with severe liver injury: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-12

Date reviewed: 2018-12-22

Review time: 1 Hour, 10 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Liu et al. reports a rare case with erythropoietic protoporphyria showing severe liver injury. They made the clinical diagnosis after extensive examinations including liver biopsy. They also perform the genetic analysis and found a possible new mutation locus which may be related to the disease. The

report was well written and analyzed.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No