

ANSWERING REVIEWERS



August 10, 2013

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 4512-review.doc).

Title: Effect of branched-chain amino acids in patients receiving intervention for hepatocellular carcinoma

Author: Tomoaki Ishihara, Motoh Iwasa, Hideaki Tanaka, Masahiko Kaito, Jiro Ikoma, Toshiya Shibata and Yoshiyuki Takei

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4512

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

(1) Title was changed to "Effect of branched-chain amino acids in patients receiving intervention for hepatocellular carcinoma" (12 words).

(2) Some statements were added in the abstract section.

(3) We reformatted all the reference numbers.

(4) We added "Comment" section in the revised manuscript.

(5) We added PubMed citation numbers and DOI citation to the reference list.

(6) We added new references (no. 3, 5, 7, 8, 11-13, 25, 26) in the revised manuscript (total 26 references).

(7) It would be useful to have data on one more marker of HCC other than just C-reactive protein. This would enhance the overall quality of the paper. It is stated that 270 patients were included in this study. TACE was performed in 162 patients, 76 were BCAA pretreated and 86 were non-pretreated with BCAA. In table 1 and 2 are described the demographic characteristics of this group but numbers do not fit. Numbers in the table are 73 (38 control group, 35 BCAA treated group) and not 162 (76 control Group and 86 BCAA treated group). 2- Figure 2 is related to results of RFA group, but numbers in parenthesis are those of TACA group (38 control and 35 BCAA treated) Differences statistically significant Most of data related to differences between control and treated groups are not statistically different. TACE group, Fig 1, 4/9 values are statistically different. Fig 3, 0/1, of twelve points non are statistically different. RFA group Fig 2, 0/9, non out of nine points measured showed differences statistically significant. Fig 4, 2/12, in two out of twelve points there are differences statistically significant Fig 5 there is not a correlation of the effect of BCAA pretreatment between changes in serum CRP and changes in serum albumin in TACE group. Besides all de inconsistencies mentioned, authors did not present evidence that BCAA pretreatment reduces postoperative complications. I will take part of the text of the manuscript as my final conclusion after evaluation, Page 12, second paragraph " The present results suggest that BCAA treatment prior therapeutic intervention suppresses a decrease in serum Alb level associated with TACE or RFA and may reduce postoperative complications although confirmation of such effect observed in this study through prospective investigation and clarification of the underlying mechanism are needed" In conclusion I agree with authors if there is a reduction of

postoperative complications it is necessary to have a follow up of these patients and for the manuscript to be published, results of this follow up should be part of this manuscript.

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*.

Sincerely yours,

Motoh Iwasa, M.D. Ph.D.,

Address: Department of Gastroenterology and Hepatology, Mie University Graduate School of Medicine

Edobashi 2-174, Tsu, Mie 514-8507, Japan.

E-mail: motoh@clin.medic.mie-u.ac.jp

FAX: 81-59-231-5223