



Weill Cornell Medical College

┌ NewYork-Presbyterian Hospital  
└ Weill Cornell Medical Center

Department of Medicine  
Division of Gastroenterology and Hepatology

1305 York Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10021

March 6, 2019

To the Editorial Board

Re WJG Manuscript No 45845: A systematic review with meta-analysis on transplantation for alcohol-related liver disease: Very low evidence of improved outcomes

To the Editorial Board,

Thank you for your interest and the critique of our manuscript. As suggested by reviewer 2, we have proofread our manuscript and corrected a few typographical and grammatical errors. We have reformatted our manuscript and added the additional sections as requested by the editor. We have additionally reformatted the attached PowerPoint figure file as per the special comments from the editor. Where possible, we recreated words using text-box, but unfortunately, figures created in STATA cannot be further decomposed than they currently are in the PowerPoint file.

We have enclosed a point-by-point response to the editor's and reviewers' comments and the revised manuscript with all changes highlighted.

As indicated previously, all of the authors contributed materially to the work and have approved the current version. Nothing related to this manuscript has been published or submitted for publication elsewhere. All authors have provided appropriate disclosures.

Thank you for reviewing our work. We think the results and recommendations will be of great interest to your readership.

All the best and kind regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Nicole Shen'.

Nicole T. Shen, MD, MSc  
Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality T32  
Fellow of Clinical Epidemiology  
Gastroenterology Fellow

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Robert S. Brown Jr.'.

Robert S. Brown Jr, MD, MPH  
Gladys and Roland Harriman Professor of Medicine  
Clinical Chief, Division of Gastroenterology and  
Hepatology

### **Reviewer code 01799105 comments to the authors:**

This is a highly labour intensive study assessing the outcome measures in alcoholic liver disease with or without liver transplantation. The authors compiled large data and reviewed it succinctly. They revealed that there is a great deal of non-standardization in the area which makes the assessment of the role of liver transplantation very difficult. Well written.

Thank you, we appreciate the supportive feedback.

### **Reviewer code 00253956 comments to the authors:**

A systematic review of liver transplants related to alcohol-liver disease is a timely manuscript that will be a useful reference for scientists and clinicians working in this field. Systematic reviews and meta-analyses are useful if sufficient and high-quality studies can be utilised to provide end-points that are quantitative and statistically sound. The authors undertake an unbiased approach by covering all relevant published papers via a systematic review. The authors highlight a number of defects and deficits in current reporting that limits the statistical strength and also consider the publication bias associated with liver transplant studies. This represents an important step in the field with suggestions for how other related prospective studies could be improved. Overall, I have no reservations about recommending publication pending a proofread to correct a few typographical and grammatical errors.

Thank you, we appreciate the feedback and have proofread the manuscript, correcting typographical and grammatical errors as highlighted throughout the submitted revision.

### **Reviewer code 00069262 comments to the authors:**

The work of Dr. Nicole T. Shen, is very well presented, describes in its review study the meta-analysis on transplantation for alcohol-related liver disease. Congratulations The tables and figures are very academic, and the analysis of the literature is adequate.

Thank you, we appreciate the supportive feedback.

### **Editor's comments to author:**

Audio core tip:

In order to attract readers to read your full-text article, we request that the author make an audio file describing your final core tip, it is necessary for final acceptance. Please refer to Instruction to authors on our website or attached Format for detailed information. The accepted formats are mp3 or wma.

We have done this.

Please provide the decomposable figure of all the figures, whose parts are all movable and editable, organize them into a PowerPoint file, and submit as "Manuscript No. - image files.ppt" on the system. Make sure that the layers in the PPT file are fully editable. For figures, use distinct colors with comparable visibility and consider colorblind individuals by avoiding the use of red and green for contrast.

As requested, we have submitted a PowerPoint file of all manuscript images with all words, where possible, entered using text-box. Unfortunately, figures created in STATA cannot be further decomposed then they currently are in the PowerPoint file.

Your manuscript should be prepared with Word-processing Software, using 12 pt Book Antiqua font and 1.5 line spacing with ample margins.

We have made this change.

Please revise and perfect your manuscript according to peer-reviewers' comments. Please upload the required files on the system.

Our peer-reviewers did not provide specific comments to address. Only reviewer 2 suggested a "proofread to correct a few typographical and grammatical errors," which we have done.

The editor also made suggestions throughout the word document that we have addressed. These included adding to the title page the "Name of Journal," the "Manuscript NO," the "Manuscript Type," the "Running title," the "ORCID number," the "Biostatistics statement," the "Data sharing statement," and the "PRISMA 2009 Checklist statement."

According to the editor's recommendation, we have rearranged the authors' affiliations and reformatted the "Author contributions" and the "Corresponding author."

Upon request, we have provided the grant statement of appointment paperwork for the two years of funding (from July 2017 to June 2019).

As suggested, we have explained all abbreviations used in the abstract. We have modified the format of the abstract in agreement with the journal layout and word count restrictions.

We have modified our key words following the recommendations.

As requested, we have added a "core tip" and the "Article Highlights" section to our manuscript.

We have corrected our cited references within the text and on the reference page to follow the guidelines of *World Journal of Gastroenterology* formatting.

We have reformatted our reporting of statistical significance as requested.

Lastly, we have followed the editor recommendations for formatting of the figures. We specifically avoid contrasting red and green in consideration of colorblind individuals. We do not include abbreviations in the title of our figures or tables. We have reformatted our abbreviations in our figures and tables. All abbreviations of each figure and table are explained under each figure and table. As recommended, superscript numbers are used within tables for illustration, and we have separated our supplementary materials into a separate PDF.